



Whole Class Ensemble Teaching (WCET)
Final Report
September 2016

Professor Susan Hallam MBE, UCL Institute of Education
Music Mark – The UK Association for Music Education

Whole Class Ensemble Teaching (WCET): Final Report

Key Findings

It is possible to implement WCET in ways that lead to high standards of instrumental playing and high continuation rates.

For WCET to be successful senior and other school staff need to be supportive and committed to the programme. Mutual positive partnership between providers and individual schools leads to successful WCET provision.

WCET is more successful where children have experience of high quality general class music lessons prior to WCET.

WCET teachers need to have high expectations of what participating children can achieve.

Differentiation through high quality music materials and arrangements is required to meet the musical needs of all children.

WCET teachers need to be enthusiastic, inspirational and have a wide range of teaching strategies.

Participating children need to be given opportunities to practise at home or school.

Children need to be given the opportunity for participating in frequent performances including those in prestigious environments.

Parental support is crucial in supporting continuation. High quality performances are crucial for engaging parents.

High continuation rates require opportunities for seamless transition to music hub ensembles or ensembles with other schools.

Continuation may be through:

- ongoing whole class tuition;
- large or small group tuition;
- individual tuition (offered by the hub or privately);
- membership of a hub ensemble;
- independent learning (e.g. peer learning, internet learning).

Ways of collating data relating to each of these need to be found.

Head teachers recognise the value of the programme in developing the intellectual, personal and social skills of the children.

Schools and hubs are concerned about the financial challenges of the ongoing implementation of WCET.

The challenges facing WCET providers vary depending on location (urban or rural) and levels of deprivation.

Executive summary

Introduction

In 2001, the government in England pledged in the White Paper *Schools Achieving Success* that over time all primary school pupils who wanted to should have the opportunity to learn to play a musical instrument. Focusing on pupils at Key Stage 2 (ages 7-11), this built on and extended the statutory entitlement to music education provided by the National Curriculum and became known as the ‘Wider Opportunities’ programme. Since then the initiative has developed in response to the National Plan for Music Education (2011), government requirements and the findings of research relating to it. Changes in the wider education system since 2001 now make it timely for providers to reassess what they offer in their programmes to meet the needs of schools, children and parents going forward.

The aims of the research

The aims of the current research were three-fold:

- to identify examples of high quality Whole Class Ensemble Teaching (WCET) with a view to video-recording them and making the recordings widely available to providers and others involved in the training or CPD of WCET teachers;
- to provide a context for WCET identifying the nature of programmes on offer, the role of schools, and the challenges faced;
- to investigate how WCET can make best use of music education hubs specialist instrumental teaching and learning pedagogy in whole classes to encourage further musical development and interest amongst young people.

The research design

Stage 1: Providers of WCET who were members of Music Mark were invited to submit proposals for individual instrumental teachers working in specific schools to be included in the research with a view to being video-recorded. Providers were asked to set out the key elements of their programme that they believed contributed to its success and details about the length of the programme, whether it was part of a carousel, the length of lessons, whether whole or part classes were taught, the instruments taught, and which teachers were involved. Information was also requested about the opportunities that pupils had for performance. Fifty-one proposals were received from 40 different providers.

On the basis of this information the steering group convened by Music Mark proposed that visits be undertaken to 22 schools where the instrumental teaching would be observed. The research team finalised the programmes to be visited taking account of the advice of the steering group while also ensuring a balance of instruments, length of programme and how the programme was delivered.

Stage 2: Between February 8th and April 26th 2016, 22 visits were made to schools where the instrumental teaching was deemed to represent ‘good’ practice by their music hub.

The visits included:

- discussion with the head teacher or other member of the senior management team about how the programme contributed to the school in terms of the musical

- development of the children and staff, any other benefits and any challenges that they faced. Where senior staff were not available they were emailed following the visit;
- discussion with the WCET teacher(s) about the aims of the programme and the observed session;
- observation of the lesson. A detailed written record was made of what occurred in each lesson;
- brief discussion with pupils as they entered and left lessons;
- follow up discussion with the WCET teacher(s);
- discussion or email contact with the provider to explore their beliefs about what contributed to the success of the programme, how they assessed success and the challenges that they faced.

Analysis of data: The detailed accounts of the teaching were summarised and key exemplary features identified. The data gathered from hub leaders, school senior managers and pupils were analysed identifying emerging themes in a process set out by Cooper and McIntyre (1993).

Findings

The factors identified as key to the success of programmes included:

Partnership working between providers and individual schools including:

- partnership support from the Senior Management Team;
- involvement of school staff and professional development opportunities for them;
- flexibility to meet the needs of schools;
- complementing existing provision in schools; and
- musical learning prior to the commencement of WCET.

The quality of teaching including:

- enthusiastic and inspiring WCET teachers with high expectations;
- the enjoyment and engagement of the children;
- facilitation of the development of general musical skills, specific authentic instrumental skills, creative skills, musical literacy, and transferable skills;
- links with the National Curriculum for music and the musical life of schools;
- differentiation;
- pupil choice;
- ensemble experiences;
- high quality materials;
- appropriate instrumental resources;
- opportunities for children to undertake practice between lessons;
- quality assurance in terms of instrumental teaching.

Opportunities for performance

Progression routes following the programme

Partnership working between providers and individual schools

The commitment of the school senior management team was crucial to the success of the music programme as was the commitment and involvement of school staff. In the schools where the observations took place class teachers and teaching assistants supported learning, some taking up opportunities to learn to play instruments themselves. In some schools, school staff took rehearsals or ‘clinics’ during the week. Class teachers or teachers were present during the lessons and offered support to children who were experiencing difficulties. In some cases they supported the WCET teacher by dealing with minor problems with instruments.

Providers had a wide range of programmes to offer schools. These varied in terms of the year groups to be taught, the length of lessons and the size of groups to be taught. The length of the provision reported varied from half a term to six years although the majority of the sample provided tuition for a whole year. All observed lessons were in Key Stage 2 (KS2). While there was variability in the specific year group participating, typically WCET was offered in Year 4. This provided opportunities for children to participate in general class music prior to WCET gaining important basic musical skills also giving them sufficient opportunities to develop high level instrumental skills before progressing to secondary schools. The great majority of lessons were either 60 minutes or 45 minutes. Almost all participating providers taught whole classes. Providers offered a wide range of whole class instrumental tuition to schools. Nine offered a carousel of instruments, some in specific year groups. In some cases classes focused on an individual instrument, others combined a range of percussion instruments in samba groups or steel pan groups. Several offered a 'band' approach where there was a mix of instruments, strings, brass or woodwind. Recorder, tin whistle, ocarina or fife tended to be offered in Year 3 in preparation for learning other instruments in later school years.

In some cases WCET was in place for most school year groups. This ensured immediate continuation and was successful in embedding high quality music provision across the school. Following WCET a range of continuation activities were offered including whole class, large groups, small groups and individual tuition.

Providers were increasingly recognising that 'one size did not fit all' and that they needed to be able to offer a range of programmes to schools.

In some cases children had begun to play instruments prior to the WCET programme. Providers adopted a range of strategies to manage this. Most of the schools visited had a range of musical groups in which the children could participate. Sometimes these were directly related to the WCET programme and in other cases complementary to it. They included choirs, bands, orchestras, ukulele clubs and recorder groups.

Generalist musical tuition prior to learning to play an instrument was seen to be hugely important in the success of WCET programmes. This sometimes included learning the recorder, ocarina, fife or tin whistle. In some cases tutors were involved in generalist and specialist programmes which supported transition.

The quality of teaching

High quality teaching facilitated the development of general musical skills, specialist instrumental skills, creative skills, musical literacy, and transferable skills.

The most successful teachers had very high expectations of what participating children could achieve.

The pace of teaching varied between WCET teachers. A faster pace with activities linking swiftly one to another meant that the children remained focused and did not become disengaged.

There was variability in the extent to which WCET teachers attempted to improve the performance of particular exercises or pieces of music once they had been learned. Some

provided extensive feedback in relation to all activities. This was less the case for singing which largely seemed to be adopted as a vehicle for learning notation or the sounds of a piece to be learnt on instruments.

WCET teachers provided clear explanations and in most lessons question and answer sessions were short and to the point. Where these were lengthy some children lost concentration.

While the children concentrated when they carried out exercises there was a clear advantage when they were playing pieces of music. A focus on making music was important for performing which was a key factor in engaging parents

WCET teachers frequently used demonstration. This was in relation to rhythm exercises, singing of new pieces to be learned and instrumental skills. Some teachers demonstrated to the children how to practice.

All of the WCET teachers observed had a good rapport with the children.

The observations and the conversations with the children left no doubt as to the extent to which they enjoyed the lessons. Many of the children spoken to informally indicated that it was the most enjoyable activity of the week.

Successful lessons typically included the playing of well known music, pieces which required improvement and new pieces which offered challenge, although there was variation in relation to this depending on whether concerts were imminent.

The development of general music skills: There was variability in the extent to which programmes emphasised that they met the requirements of the National Curriculum (NC). Some providers indicated that this was the purpose of the programme, while others had a more specialist instrumental focus, while also meeting NC requirements. In some classes, particular attention was given to children learning the terminology and understanding the meaning of musical concepts. In other cases the terms were used as part of the explanation and feedback process in relation to learning the instrument.

The development of specialist instrumental skills: There was wide variation in the time spent on the teaching of specific instrumental skills and on particular activities, for instance warm up exercises. Most teachers adopted highly effective rehearsal techniques with much constructive feedback and praise for the children as they improved. A key difference between observed lessons was in terms of expectations of what could be achieved. Expectations varied between those teaching the same instruments and were substantial.

In most of the schools visited the children were not allowed to take instruments home to practise and there was no provision for them to practise at school. In some cases WCET teachers gave pupils a few moments to carry out individual practice in lessons or to work in pairs. Some WCET teachers encouraged mental practice, silently rehearsing fingerings while others were playing. Given the lack of practice opportunities it is surprising that the pupils achieved the standards that they did.

Creative skills: All of the providers included composition and improvisation as part of their programmes. Examples of both were seen in the observations. Improvisation was more common than composition. Children typically improvised individually as part of a longer

piece of music. Improvisation was more meaningful musically when the teacher provided guidance as to what notes to include.

Musical literacy: In all observed classes children learnt to play by ear. There was variability in the extent to which there was a focus on reading traditional musical notation even when children were learning instruments which required literacy to participate in traditional ensembles. Initial introductions to notation tended to focus on rhythm. In some generalist classes prior to WCET quite young children were observed to have developed considerable facility in reading rhythmic patterns.

Assessing the development of musical skills: All providers indicated that assessing children's progress was important. The extent to which this was formalised varied. Some providers had developed assessment systems which assessed progress on the instrument and in relation to musical skills. Several providers made use of Arts Award Discover, some finding it useful for adapting their teaching to pupil needs.

Transferable skills: Teachers (class and WCET) and members of the senior management teams of schools commented on the non-musical outcomes for pupils including performing skills, confidence, self-esteem, concentration, improved behaviour, resilience, perseverance, independence, listening skills, team working, peer support, and creativity.

Differentiation: Differentiation was approached in several ways. Some providers arranged parts to provide easy and more difficult tasks for the children. Sectional rehearsals in two programmes enabled more individual attention for pupils. WCET teachers also devised ways to challenge more advanced pupils. In most observed classes teaching assistants offered support to children with Special Educational Needs and Disabilities. Class teachers commented that children with SEND and those with English as an Additional Language were able to participate in the WCET programme on an equal basis with other children.

Pupil choice: Pupil choice was catered for in a range of different ways. This was sometimes in terms of the instrument played but also in terms of repertoire and opportunities for improvisation and composition.

Ensemble experiences: All WCET programmes provided ensemble opportunities in terms of the whole class experience. The extent to which this provided an authentic musical experience varied. Where WCET took the form of orchestra or band, the ensemble activity was authentic, particularly when the children were playing different parts. Where single instruments were taught the experience was frequently enhanced musically by the use of backing tracks which provided accompaniment. It is important for continuation that children are seen to have an authentic musical experience that is recognised by others, particularly parents. Parents are more likely to support continuation if the musical activities that they see when their child is performing are of a high standard and they are able to recognise them as being perceived of value in the wider community.

High quality materials: Many WCET teachers made use of white boards and backing tracks in their teaching. They were skilled in doing so. The quality of these materials varied. Many of the most successful had been developed by the teachers themselves to meet the needs of their classes. All of the observed teachers had developed complex rhythm and pitch games to support children in developing their general musical skills. Most had developed exercises to support the learning of technical instrumental skills.

Where backing tracks were played to accompany children learning brass instruments they were sometimes difficult to hear when the children were playing unless they were played at very high volume. Some providers made Charanga available to their WCET teachers. This had the advantage of children being able to use it at home.

Where WCET was based on brass or windbands, WCET staff had frequently made their own arrangements as there was perceived to be a lack of appropriate resources. These facilitated differentiation and enabled authentic performance.

Appropriate instrumental resources: The instruments observed in the teaching sessions were generally of good quality. However, there were examples where children had to share instruments in lessons. A challenge for WCET teachers was carrying out small repairs during lessons while maintaining musical activities. In some cases class teachers or TAs had learned how to carry out small scale maintenance. This was extremely effective. In many cases the children could not take the instruments home to practise as they were shared between classes, although there were cases where they could have been taken home but the school or provider would not allow this.

Enthusiastic and inspiring WCET teachers: The observations found evidence of high quality WCET and enthusiastic and inspiring WCET teachers. Senior staff in schools indicated that the personal qualities and professional skills of the WCET teacher were crucial to the success of the programme. Particularly important were the rapport that the WCET teacher developed with the students and the expectations that they had of them which led to high standards of performance.

Quality assurance issues: Several providers indicated that they had training programmes for new instrumental staff who were inducted into WCET through an apprenticeship model where they worked with an experienced WCET teacher before teaching alone. Several also monitored the quality of teaching of all of their teachers.

Opportunities for performance: All of the programmes recognised the importance of performance and almost all offered performance opportunities within the school where the programme was implemented. This was frequently in the context of school assemblies, concerts or specific festivals. About a quarter of the children were able to participate in ensembles with other local schools, while over half of the responding providers organised mass events for children participating in WCET sometimes in prestigious locations.

Progression routes: In the original submissions and later in relation to school visits providers were asked to provide continuation rates. The percentage continuation rates that were reported varied from 15% to 100%. The issue of continuation rates is sensitive and contentious and can be considered in a number of ways including continuation of WCET, large group electives, small group tuition, individual tuition or participation in extra-curricular activities. Where schools continue to fund WCET beyond its initial implementation this is an indication of its success and the value that schools place on it. Current ways of assessing progression do not take account of ongoing informal learning.

Some providers had recognised that continuation required opportunities to be available which provided a smooth transition from what was essentially a school based classroom activity to activities where the children were developing an identity as a musician with music as part of their social life.

Providers and schools were aware of the financial constraints precluding some families from supporting their children to continue with small group tuition. The Pupil Premium was sometimes used to support continuation. Providers sometimes reduced fees for a period of time to encourage continuation.

Providers commented on the importance of children having the opportunity to see inspiring performances by professional musicians, in some cases their own teachers, to develop their aspirations and support choice of instruments. Children were also inspired by seeing and listening to more advanced children playing either within school or through large concerts arranged by the hub.

Overall, it is clear that it is possible to have high rates of continuation, although geographical constraints and issues in areas of social deprivation are particularly challenging for some providers.

Assessing success: The main ways in which providers assessed their success were the musical progress of the children, feedback from schools and continuation rates.

Wider benefits of WCET for schools: In addition to the benefits to their pupils school staff perceived other benefits of the WCET programme. Where the children performed to a high standard, parents, particularly those who previously had no contact with the school, increased their engagement. Generally, parents were surprised by and impressed with the standards achieved. The programme had the potential to enhance the reputation of the school externally and internally enhance ethos and school climate. Schools also reported that the programme offered the staff an opportunity to interact with the children in a different context as they were not leading the lesson.

Challenges identified by providers and schools: Providers and schools raised concerns about financial pressures and competing demands on budgets. Providers in rural areas faced particular financial challenges in terms of being able to offer free access to all remote and small schools.

Providers faced challenges in engaging schools and persuading them to commit fully to the programme. School staff were sometimes reluctant to collaborate or participate. There were sometimes difficulties in communication with schools and timetabling was an issue as schools increasingly did not want instrumental tuition in the morning. Teaching accommodation was increasingly a problem particularly as schools were expanding the number of children on roll.

The nature of WCET staff contracts, particularly when staff were self-employed created challenges, particularly in rural areas, in recruiting and replacing WCET staff. The hourly paid nature of much of the work force was challenging in terms of delivering Continuing Professional Development (CPD) which was perceived as crucial to address the lack of relevant skills in new staff, the need for existing staff to update their skills particularly in relation to differentiation and inclusion, and the need to develop materials for teaching.

Maintaining high continuation rates was a concern shared by most providers. The challenges were greater for providers in rural areas and where children were from homes of low socio-economic status.

Conclusions

The findings of this research demonstrate that it is possible to implement WCET in ways that lead to high standards of instrumental playing and high continuation rates.

To raise standards across the sector requires WCET teachers to have high expectations and to pay greater attention to the development of instrumental skills while continuing to make use of relevant games, exercises and singing to support the development of more general musical skills. For most children WCET provides their first introduction to playing an instrument. If they are to continue to engage with making music, this experience must be of high quality.

Enhancing rates of continuation requires providers to have planned progression routes, which support children in making the transition from a class based activity to one where they identify themselves as musicians and musical activities become a part of their social life outside school. The importance of high quality performances in ensuring the support of parents in this process cannot be overestimated.

While what constitutes continuation remains a contentious and sensitive issue, it is clear that high rates of continuation are possible where the appropriate systems are in place. Ideally, these include:

- high quality general music teaching prior to the WCET programme;
- high quality WCET teaching with high expectations of what can be achieved;
- opportunities to continue instrumental tuition in whole, large, small or individual classes;
- plentiful opportunities for performance in and out of school with some in prestigious environments;
- a range of ensemble provision which children can engage with while participating in WCET or immediately after which seamlessly link with higher level ensemble provision.

There is also a need to devise ways of recording continuation which occurs in other hub organisations and informally.

For further resources and to download this report please visit:

www.musicmark.org.uk/WCETresearch

Whole Class Ensemble Teaching: Final Report

Introduction

In 2001, the government in England pledged in the White Paper *Schools Achieving Success* that over time all primary school pupils who wanted to should have the opportunity to learn to play a musical instrument. Focusing on pupils at Key Stage 2 (ages 7-11), this built on and extended the statutory entitlement to music education provided by the National Curriculum and became known as the 'Wider Opportunities' programme.

Following this, in 2004, the Music Manifesto was launched with the intention of bringing together interested parties who would sign up to its aims which were to:

- provide every young person with first access to a range of music experiences;
- provide more opportunities for young people to deepen and broaden their musical interests and skills;
- identify and nurture the most talented musicians;
- develop a world class workforce in music education; and
- improve the support structures for young people making music.

The manifesto which had 2000 signatories provided support for the original government commitment.

To further the development of the Wider Opportunities programme, a range of instrumental and vocal models were piloted and evaluated (Ofsted, 2004; Youth Music, 2004). Three common elements of the programme were:

- taster sessions: a variety of live and hands on musical experiences to stimulate interest and broaden musical perspectives;
- foundation activities: general musicianship experiences across a range of instruments and voice to develop disciplined musical skills, knowledge and understanding; and
- specialist instrumental tuition: the opportunity to go on and learn a musical instrument generally in a whole class setting, including ensemble playing, composition and performance and specialist tuition in small and large groups. Ofsted (2004) recommended that the tuition phase should last for at least one year.

Evaluation of the pilot projects was extremely positive. Ofsted commented that the Wider Opportunities policy was 'leading to the significant transformation of music education for all pupils in KS2' (Ofsted, 2005). New musical traditions had been introduced into schools and more children wished to learn instruments. The quality of teaching was judged to be better than that in conventional KS2 sessions. Lessons were planned and taught by a combination of freelance and community musicians, Music Service tutors, classroom teachers and teaching assistants. This provided opportunities for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for all of those participating. Classroom teachers were able to learn instrumental skills from visiting musicians while the musicians developed an in-depth understanding of the school context, classroom management and the wider music curriculum. Participating schools took advantage of a wide range of local specialist provision including that from Music Services, voluntary and community music groups, a range of independent providers, Youth Music Action Zone resources, visiting composers, local orchestras, opera companies and bands. In some cases strong partnerships were also established with music industry bodies including instrument makers and retailers (Ofsted, 2004; Youth Music, 2004).

A survey in 2007 (Hallam et al.), showed that Music Services had made considerable progress in providing every child with the opportunity to play an instrument. Whole class instrumental tuition was the most commonly reported strategy (72 per cent of LAs) followed by whole class vocal tuition (40 per cent of LAs). Barriers to implementation included insufficient staff, lack of instruments, conflict with other priorities, timetabling difficulties, inadequate accommodation and the lack of expertise of primary school teachers. Factors supporting the initiative, in addition to the funding, were supportive head teachers and the high profile of music education. The Ofsted report *Making more of Music* (2009) confirmed the important role of LA Music Services in taking forward the Government's commitment to enabling every pupil to have the opportunity to learn to play a musical instrument. The programme, at its best, was reported as having a considerable impact in raising expectations and standards, encouraging wider participation, and increasing classroom teachers' confidence and subject knowledge.

The most recent impact evaluation (Bamford and Glinkowski, 2010) reported that the programme had received widespread positive support from pupils, parents, teachers, head teachers and Local Authorities. In addition to enabling the children to acquire a range of musical skills it raised self-esteem and confidence, enhanced aspirations, and increased focus, empowerment and responsibility. During Wider Opportunity sessions the children were motivated, showed increased concentration and improved behaviour, had positive attitudes towards learning, showed respect for their instruments and enjoyed the lessons. The programme also raised the profile of music in the school, increased the level of musical activity, raised expectations, changed teachers' perceptions of some pupils, ensured that music was on the curriculum, enhanced the profile of the school, increased recruitment, enhanced the involvement of parents and families, encouraged schools to form networks and collaborate with each other, led to greater involvement in community initiatives, and in some schools provided a catalyst for change. Successful programmes built partnerships between the child, the family, the school and Music Services. The programme allowed talent to be identified, nurtured and developed, and challenged the value of individual lessons over group lessons. Celebratory events acted as powerful drivers for quality enhancement and were influential as advocacy tools. One aim of the programme had been to provide professional development for generalist primary teachers through paired teaching. This was found to have not been consistently implemented, although many Music Services made good use of the national training programme offered by Trinity Guildhall and the Open University, although there were still issues related to shortage of staff. The report also indicated that there was a diversity of espoused aims with some arguing that the programme should be aimed at instrumental learning, while others proposed that the aim should be focused on music learning through the instrument. In practice there was a greater emphasis given in most cases to the enjoyment and experience of making music rather than a strong focus on musical and instrumental skill development. However, the report argued that enjoyment and making progress in skill and musical development were complementary rather than mutually exclusive.

In February 2011, The Henley Review was published and recommended the establishment of music hubs to coordinate the strategic operation of music education in local and regional areas. Following this, the National Plan for Music Education was published in November 2011. The Plan set out proposals for these hubs to start in September 2012. Other recommendations included the development of strategies for training music education professionals and improving the use of technology in music education. The vision was *'to enable children from all backgrounds to have the opportunity to learn a musical instrument;*

to make music with others; to learn to sing; and to have the opportunity to progress to the next level of excellence'. Hubs were to have four core roles:

- ensure that every child aged 5-18 had the opportunity to learn a musical instrument (other than voice) through whole-class ensemble tuition programmes for ideally a year (but for a minimum of a term) of weekly tuition on the same instrument;
- provide opportunities to play in ensembles and to perform from an early stage;
- ensure that clear progression routes were available and affordable to all young people;
- develop a strategy to ensure that every pupil sang regularly and that choirs and other vocal ensembles were available in the area.

Hubs were to complement, augment and support what schools offered. Pupils engaging in hub activities were expected to continue to support their school ensembles. The Arts Council was to formally monitor hubs, while Ofsted inspections were also to contribute to the monitoring.

In the same year, the Ofsted triennial report on music (2011), *Wider Still and Wider* indicated that 'in too many schools, curriculum planning for the following years took little or no account of any learning that had taken place during the Wider Opportunities year. As a result, in these schools, pupils did not make good progress following the initial whole-class instrumental programmes. The quality of teaching and assessment in music also varied considerably. Examples of memorable, inspiring and musical teaching were observed. However, in too many instances there was insufficient emphasis on active music-making or on the use of musical sound as the dominant language of learning. Too much use was made of verbal communication and non-musical activities. In too many cases there was not enough music in music lessons. Across the primary schools visited, inspectors found considerable variation in the impact of the nationally funded whole-class instrumental and/or vocal tuition programmes, more commonly known as 'Wider Opportunities'. Survey evidence showed very clearly that some schools and groups of pupils were benefiting far more than others from these programmes. Inspectors found wide differences in the continued participation and inclusion of pupils from different groups. Pupils with special educational needs, children who were looked after, and those known to be eligible for free school meals were considerably less likely to be involved in additional musical activities than others. Additional musical activities included individual or small-group instrumental/vocal tuition, and extracurricular music groups. In almost all schools, these were provided in addition to regular whole-class curriculum lessons. Schools evaluated overall as good or outstanding ensured that pupils from all backgrounds enjoyed sustained opportunities through regular classroom work and music-making for all, complemented by additional tuition, partnerships and extra-curricular activities. Headteachers in these schools were key to assuring the quality of teaching in music. They ensured that music had a prominent place in the curriculum and that partnership working provided good value for money. However, not enough senior leaders demonstrated sufficient understanding of what was needed to secure good music education for all their pupils. While two thirds of the primary schools were participating in 'Wider Opportunities' programmes, the length and quality of these projects were variable, and continuation rates were too low. The most recent key data report on Music Education Hubs (Sharp, 2015) noted that just under a third of pupils continued to learn an instrument after receiving WCET in the previous year. This continuation rate was influenced by a number of factors, including the willingness of schools and parents to encourage, support and pay for children's instrumental learning.

The aims of the research

Given the contextual factors set out above, the aims of the current research were three-fold:

- to identify examples of high quality WCET with a view to video-recording them and making the recordings widely available to providers and others involved in the training or CPD of WCET teachers;
- to provide a context for the teaching identifying the nature of programmes on offer, the role of schools, and the challenges faced;
- to investigate how WCET can make best use of music education hubs specialist instrumental teaching and learning pedagogy in whole classes to encourage further musical development and interest amongst young people.

Different terminology is currently used in describing programmes including Widening Participation, First Access and Whole Class Instrumental Tuition (WCET). This report will refer to all programmes as WCET.

The research design and methods

Stage 1: Providers of WCET who were members of Music Mark were invited to submit proposals for individual instrumental teachers working in specific schools to be included in the research with a view to being video-recorded. The providers were asked to set out the key elements of their programme which they believed contributed to its success, for example:

- How does the programme take account of, and build on, pupils' prior musical learning?
- What are the expected outcomes for the year and how do they demonstrate high musical expectations beyond those that would normally be achieved through good classroom music provision?
- How does the programme offer differentiated learning, for example, extending pupils who are already learning an instrument or otherwise have more advanced musical skills and supporting SEND or other pupils who may not readily achieve the expected outcomes?
- How does the programme lead to further musical learning: specialist instrumental/vocal lessons, classroom music and other opportunities in and out of school?
- How does the programme support pupils to make an informed choice about the music making they would like to pursue in the future?

They were also asked to include details about the length of the programme, whether it was part of a carousel, the length of lessons, whether whole or part classes were taught, the instruments taught and which WCET teachers were involved in the teaching. Information was also requested about the opportunities that pupils had for performance. The questionnaire is included in the appendices.

Submissions

Table 1 sets out the number of providers making submissions and the number of submissions made by geographical area. The large number of submissions from London may be a reflection of the greater number of hubs in London than elsewhere. A full list of responding providers is included in the appendices.

Table 1: Summary of submissions

Geographical area	Providers submitting proposals representative of total member Music Services / Lead organisations of Music Education Hubs	Providers submitting proposals	Number of teaching observations offered
Channel Islands	100%	1	1
East of England	22%	2	6
East Midlands	33%	2	3
London	55%	16	16
North East	25%	2	3
North West	26%	6	12
South East	31%	4	5
South West	40%	4	3
West Midlands	21%	3	3
Yorkshire and Humber	13%	2	2
Total		42	54

Selection of teaching to be observed

On the basis of the submitted information, using the criteria set out below, the steering group proposed that visits be undertaken to 22 schools where the instrumental teaching would be observed.

The criteria

- WCET should take account of, and build on, pupils' prior musical learning.
- WCET should include specific instrumental learning skills over and above those which would normally be developed in good classroom music provision, for example basic posture, clear tone and able to play short pieces confidently and accurately using four or five notes (or three or four chords) and rhythms with more than one note length on a non-classroom percussion instrument.
- WCET should include musical learning which will be taken forward in subsequent school classroom music, for example, improvising four beat rhythms and melodic phrases, understanding rhythm notation for at least two note lengths and three note melodic notation, singing or playing with simple second parts, use of music for different purposes, able to improve own work with guidance, play music from popular, classical and folk traditions, perform a solo in class, perform to others in a group in or out of school.
- Following the WCET year pupils should have the opportunity to learn the same or another instrument at an affordable cost, both immediately and also at a later stage, e.g. at secondary school, building on the musical learning in the WCET year and any subsequent musical activity in school.

The process of selection was guided by the research team who graded submissions from 1 to 10 with 10 being the highest score based on the features of the programme which were perceived to make it successful and responses to the multiple choice questions. Grades were based on:

- how the programme took account of pupils' prior musical experience;

- whether musical expectations were high and beyond those normally achieved through good classroom music provision;
- the extent to which the programme offered differentiated learning;
- the extent to which the programme facilitated progression;
- how the programme supported pupils to make informed choices about their current and future music making; and
- the extent to which there were performance opportunities.

The research team finalised the programmes to be visited taking account of the advice of the steering group while also ensuring a balance of instruments, length of programme and how the programme was delivered.

Stage 2: Between February 8th and April 26th 2016, 22 visits were made to schools where the instrumental teaching was deemed to represent ‘good’ practice by their hub. Table 2 sets out the lead organisation of each visit and the characteristics of the schools visited.

Table 2: School Profile of nominated WCET Programmes visited

Music Service/ Lead Organisation of MEH	Urban/Rural Description	Total Number of Pupils	Percentage of Pupils Receiving FSM*
Nottingham Music Service	Urban minor conurbation	499	5.1
Nottinghamshire County Council	Urban city and town	365	9.5
Hertfordshire Music Service	Rural town and fringe	188	10.9
Norfolk Music Service	Rural village	96	13.5
Bromley Youth Music Trust	Urban major conurbation	383	2.1
Camden Music Service	Urban major conurbation	229	29.7
Royal Greenwich Music Hub	Urban major conurbation	747	20.9
Kingston Music Service	Urban major conurbation	331	10.3
Southwark Music Service/Hub	Urban major conurbation	347	13.7
Music Partnership North – Northumberland	Urban city and town	304	17.3
Durham Music Service	Rural village	129	14.7
Durham Music Service	Urban city and town	252	31.0
Love Music Trust	Urban city and town	411	2.9
Bolton Music Service	Urban major conurbation	283	23.0
One Education Music	Urban major conurbation	238	0.8
Oxfordshire Count Music Service	Urban city and town	500	13.4
Berkshire Maestros	Rural village	128	5.5
Southampton Music Hub	Urban city and town	619	11.3
Bristol Plays Music	Urban city and town	595	4.4
Services for Education	Urban major conurbation	279	21.3
Dudley Performing Arts	Urban major conurbation	262	18.5
Herefordshire Music Service	Urban city and town	530	19.6
North Yorkshire Music Service	Rural town and fringe	96	16.9

*Percentage of Pupils Receiving FSM - number of pupils known to be eligible for and claiming free school meals expressed as a percentage of all pupils.

Data taken from EduBase, Census Data January 2016

The visits included:

- discussion with the head teacher or other member of the senior management team about how the programme contributed to the school in terms of the musical development of the children and staff, any other benefits and any challenges that they faced. Where senior staff were not available they were emailed following the visit.

- discussion with the WCET teacher(s) about the aims of the programme and the session.
- observation of the WCET teaching session(s). This was to be recorded but the initial visits revealed that teachers were uncomfortable with this so detailed notes were taken instead.
- discussion with pupils. It was not possible to arrange formal focus groups so these were informal at the start and end of lessons.
- follow up discussion with the WCET teacher(s).
- discussion or email contact with the lead provider to explore what they believed were the factors contributing to the success of the programme, how they assessed success and the challenges that they faced.

Analysis of data

The detailed accounts of the teaching were summarised and key exemplary features identified. Ofsted criteria were not used for this purpose as the observations were intended to be informative rather than evaluative. However, the high quality features identified matched well with Ofsted criteria. The latter are included in the appendices.

The data gathered from hub leaders, school senior managers and pupils were analysed identifying emerging themes in a process set out by Cooper and McIntyre (1993).

The findings

Elements considered to be crucial to success

A range of elements were set out by the programme providers which they believed were key to their success. These included:

Partnership working between providers and individual schools including:

- support from the senior management team;
- involvement of school staff and professional development opportunities for them;
- flexibility to meet the needs of schools;
- complementing existing provision in schools; and
- musical learning prior to the commencement of WCET.

The quality of teaching including:

- enthusiastic and inspiring WCET teachers with high expectations;
- the enjoyment and engagement of the children;
- facilitation of the development of general musical skills, specific authentic instrumental skills, creative skills, musical literacy, and transferable skills;
- links with the National Curriculum for music and the musical life of schools;
- differentiation;
- pupil choice;
- ensemble experiences;
- high quality materials;
- appropriate instrumental resources;
- opportunities for children to practise between lessons;
- quality assurance in terms of instrumental teaching.

Opportunities for performance

Progression routes following the programme

Partnership working between providers and individual schools

Support from the senior management team: The evidence from the school visits clearly showed the importance of the commitment of the school senior management team to the success of the music programme. Providers were very aware of this. This was well expressed by One Education Music in Manchester: *'It is essential that the roles and responsibilities of all parties involved are fully understood and that the aims of first access are clear. It is therefore vital that the programme has the full support of the head teacher who will oversee the delivery, ensuring that staff at every level are aware of the outcomes and the benefits that will be gained by their full involvement.'*

Involvement of school staff and professional development opportunities for them: All of the programmes visited provided opportunities for class teachers and teaching assistants (TAs) to learn to play the instruments that the children were learning. Some took up this opportunity. There were also a few examples where school staff supported the pupils and took rehearsals or 'clinics' during the week. Good examples of this were in Northumberland and Yorkshire and Humberside. Most class teachers were present during the lessons and offered support to children who were experiencing difficulties. In some cases they supported the WCET teacher by dealing with minor issues with instruments, for instance, dealing with sticking valves. Examples of this were seen in Yorkshire and Humberside and Hertfordshire. In one school in Nottingham, the head teacher taught the children to play the clarinet.

Flexibility to meet the needs of schools: The evidence from the original submissions and the visits to schools indicated that providers had a wide range of programmes to offer schools. These varied in terms of the year groups taught, the length of lessons and the size of groups.

Providers were not asked a direct question about the year groups that were taught as part of their WCET provision. It was clear from the visits to schools that many providers had negotiated with schools a programme that covered more than one year group. Of the 35 providers where it was possible to determine this information 16 indicated that more than one year group received whole class tuition. Three providers indicated that they taught Year 3, nine Year 4, five Year 5 and one Year 6. However, it may be that those reporting single year groups were only referring to the provision that they were submitting to be observed and that what they were able to offer schools included a wider range. Offering WCET in Year 4 seemed to be successful in allowing children to develop some basic musical skills prior to WCET while also allowing time for the development of high level instrumental skills prior to transition to secondary school.

The length of the provision reported varied from half a term to six years. Three out of 40 providers reported providing tuition for half a term, three for a whole term, three for half a year and 27 for a whole year. Four indicated provision for between one and six years. In these cases the schools were working with providers to ensure high quality music education throughout the school. For the younger children this was usually generalist music tuition, while the older children, usually from Year 4 onwards, received specialist instrumental tuition.

Seventeen out of 40 providers reported that lessons were 60 minutes. Sixteen reported lessons of 45 minutes, the remainder (7) variable lengths. The latter seemed to be because of provision being offered in different ways. There were examples of lessons of 30 minutes being taught because two different instruments were taught to all of the children. In Bromley,

three different activities, band, sectionals and small group work were each undertaken for 30 minutes.

Thirty-six providers indicated that whole classes were taught, i.e. about 30 children. Three providers indicated that half classes were taught and one variable sizes depending on the activity, band, sectionals or small group lessons.

Providers offered a wide range of whole class instrumental tuition to schools. Nine of the 40 providers offered a carousel of instruments, some in specific year groups. In some cases classes focused on an individual instrument, e.g. cornet, violin, Djembe drumming, guitar, ukulele. Some combined a range of percussion instruments in samba groups or steel pan groups. Several offered a 'band' approach where there were a mix of instruments, strings, brass, woodwind and brass. Recorder, tin whistle, ocarina or fife tended to be offered in Year 3 in preparation for learning other instruments in later school years. For instance, in Greenwich, Year 4 children learned trumpet and guitar in half-class groups for five weeks each during the first term. Through a simple questionnaire and WCET teacher recommendation, they then chose which instrument they wished to continue to play for the rest of the school year. In one school, One Education Music in Manchester provided tuition for Year 4 on trumpet and steel band, for thirty minutes each alongside secure curriculum music provision. In their 'Band on the Run' programme, Bromley Youth Music Trust offered an intensive experience where children spent 30 minutes each in windband, sectionals and small groups for a period of five weeks. The instruments included cornets, trumpets, baritones, trombones, flutes and clarinets.

All of the classes submitted for observation were taught by the instrumental teacher, usually with support from a class teacher or Teaching Assistant (TA). In some cases the class teacher or TA learned to play the instrument alongside the children. In other cases the support involved helping children who were experiencing difficulties or dealing with problems with instruments. The class teacher or TA was reported by most providers as giving support in relation to class management, although in all of the classes observed there were no issues with misbehaviour. In Nottingham, the head teacher in the school undertook some teaching as the provision was fortnightly and he taught the children in the intervening week. In Kingston, the generalist music teacher began the lesson with singing and rhythm activities, the latter involving reading notation. There were also examples where school staff provided additional rehearsal opportunities for a band during the week or provided other support such as an instrument 'clinic'.

During the visits a number of providers indicated that there was a need to be able to offer a range of programmes to schools as 'one size does not fit all.' For instance, in Manchester schools were able to make an informed choice and select a model to enhance their music offer. The most common model was to offer WCET at Year 4 - leading into specialist tuition in Years 5-6. The One Education Music model is set out in Box 1.

Box 1: Example of offer to schools

Model offered by One Education Music in Manchester

Model 1	Whole class tuition for one year on one instrument - 38 weeks
Model 2	Half class group carousel on 2 instruments for 1 or 1.5 terms each - 38 weeks
Model 3	Three Term Carousel on 3 Instruments - 38 weeks Group size from 10-30
Model 4	Whole class band programme (Soundstart) - 38 weeks
Model 5	Switch on Sound SEN accessible project - 38 weeks - 6 units of work

Southampton Music Hub had developed a new WCET programme, 'Soundbites' which included input into resources, teaching methodology and planning from all members of the service. The programme built on the success of In2Music, which had been in place for 12 years. In2Music taught one instrument per year whereas Soundbites delivered three. Soundbites following on from the Prepare 2 play programme, which delivered the national curriculum requirements in Year 3 preparing children for their initial instrumental experience.

Providers also demonstrated innovation in the programmes developed. The Music Faculty Community Learning MK initiated the development of the Bollywood Brass Project. This was aimed at Year 4 and came about as a result of a project with the London-based Bollywood Brass Band. Pupils experienced brass and dhol drum playing over the year. The programme was delivered by an experienced and specialist musician.

Overall, providers had increasingly recognised that they needed to develop programmes that offered what schools wanted in addition to meeting their own needs for pupils to continue with their musical engagement following WCET. This had led to the development of a range of programmes which met the varying needs of schools and offered teaching for different year groups, some for the youngest children preparatory to WCET.

Complementing existing provision and the musical life of schools: All of the providers offered the opportunity for children to continue their musical education with small group or individual instrumental tuition. In some hubs, for instance Birmingham, extension or elective groups were offered where larger groups continued tuition but not the whole class. In some cases children had already begun to play instruments through the provider's services or private tuition prior to participating in the WCET programme. Providers addressed this issue in different ways. For example, Guernsey Schools' Music Service offered differentiated learning in varied ways, the most common being that existing instrumentalists were encouraged to use the instrument that they already played and support other learners. Salford Music and Performing Arts Service, where some children had been learning the violin from a very early age prior to WCET either offered the children the chance to learn the viola or arranged music for their current standard. In Oxfordshire and Berkshire children already playing instruments were encouraged to learn a different instrument and also support the learning of others.

In most of the schools visited there were a range of musical groups on offer for the children to join. Sometimes these were directly related to the WCET programme. In other cases they were complementary to it. Groups offered included choirs, bands, orchestras, ukulele clubs and recorder groups.

Musical learning prior to the commencement of Whole Class Ensemble Teaching:

Musical learning prior to learning to play an instrument was seen to be hugely important in the success of WCET programmes. This was generalist class music lessons which sometimes included learning the recorder, ocarina or tin whistle. For instance, the Bromley 'Band on the Run' and Strings programmes were designed for children in Year 4 who had already gone through Bromley's Year 3 recorder programme and built on the repertoire and musical experiences that the children had already received. Many of the tutors were involved in both programmes so were familiar with the expectations and transition from recorder to brass and wind or strings.

In the school visited in Cheshire East music was delivered to Years 1-4 and Year 6 by the school's subject leader who was an experienced musician. A mixture of resources were used and the Learning Ladders assessment framework created by the Love Music Trust as part of the Primary Music Curriculum was utilised. The Learning Ladders aim to equip pupils with skills which are in line with the National Curriculum but also prepare pupils for their WCET experience. This allows tutors to focus more time on practical instrumental skills as many of the core aspects of musicianship have already become firmly embedded.

Box 2: Example of a successful programme in a large urban conurbation

The Bromley Youth Music Trust 'Band on the Run' and String programmes were designed for children in Year 4 who had already experienced the Year 3 recorder programme which provided children with general musical skills including the reading of notation. Many of the tutors taught on both programmes supporting transition. The programme is intensive. The children have three lessons a week for five weeks, 30 minutes each of band, sectionals and small group tuition (typically 3 children in a group). The expectation is that after 6 weeks all children will be able to comfortably play five pitch notes as a minimum. Repertoire has been developed to support this. The children can take their instruments home to practise and are provided with supporting materials (book and CD repertoire). In week six the children perform to their parents.

The observation took place in a larger than average primary school with a lower than average percentage of children eligible for free school meals and with SEND but a higher than average proportion of children from minority ethnic groups. The band rehearsal, which lasted for 30 minutes, was observed. The band included brass and woodwind instruments. The children all had a music folder and played using music stands. The session started with playing warm ups (copying from the WCET teacher including rhythm and pitch). This was followed by the playing of a piece fairly well known by the children and constructive critical feedback on how to improve with the children encouraged to critique themselves. Consideration was given to playing this piece from memory and doing it while marching. Marching on the spot was tried. A new piece was then tackled using exemplary learning and rehearsal techniques. Guidance was then given for how to practise this in sectionals and during individual practice. The session concluded with the playing of a piece well known to the children. Overall, the quality of the rehearsal techniques used was exemplary and it was an authentic 'band' experience. After a year every child in the Year 4 cohort had been given this comprehensive, intense experience and was then supported to continue with small group lessons alongside a full band session each week. Transition rates to small group and individual lessons were between 50% and 70%. Some pupils came to the programme with prior learning on another instrument or may have already started individual lessons. This was accommodated within the repertoire (more challenging parts) as well as using them as peer models. Moving forward from the initial project, band arrangements with multi levels of difficulty were used. As this approach had smaller group sessions as well as full band, this was particularly helpful to assess progress and adapt approaches to support the children

effectively, whether they had SEND and required extra help or indeed were more advanced and needed stretching. The school was extremely supportive. They had a governor with responsibility for music who was impressed with the quality of the provision and its outcomes and felt that music gave the school a high profile in the community. The programme was centred around progression into the school band and clear progression to the BYMT Junior Band. There were cluster Band on the Run performances with several schools that are invited to join the BYMT Junior Band for concerts. The next level is the BYMT Saturday Training Band, Senior Band, Symphonic Winds and the Bromley Youth Concert Band, the latter National and International award winners. The Bromley Youth Concert Band also performs in a concert with the BYMT Junior Band which inspires the younger students.

Box 3: Example of a successful programme in a rural area

The programme began as part of North Yorkshire Music Service's free one year WCET offer. The school used the sessions and the opportunities emerging from them as a key driver for change within the school. Two other schools in the area now follow a similar model and this has led to the development of the 'Bridge', an ensemble which links the primary schools and the local secondary school. Following this the children can join music centres and other music service ensembles. The observation of the teaching took place in a very small primary school in a rural area in Yorkshire with a generally white British population and low levels of children eligible for free school meals. Two classes were observed Years 3-4 and Years 5-6. The children were learning to play trumpet, trombone, euphonium, Eb horn, clarinet and saxophone. The lessons were for an hour and took place for the whole school year. A teaching assistant supported the teaching by taking band rehearsals on two mornings a week before school. She also carried out simple maintenance tasks with the instruments. The children took the instruments home to practise. Both classes started with a short warm up which consisted of the children playing up and down five notes for the younger children and an octave for the older children. The WCET teacher played different rhythms which the children copied. Both lessons were spent preparing for a performance in a prestigious location. The pieces had been written in parts and arranged by the WCET teacher. This enabled differentiation. The teacher referred to musical terms as the rehearsal progressed, technical issues and a series of 'golden rules' which the children knew and understood. The teacher demonstrated excellent rehearsal techniques and spent considerable time referring to dynamics and balance and the need to watch the conductor. Question and answer sessions were short and to the point. The teacher had a good rapport with the children and they were praised when they had performed well or made progress. In Year 5/6, in one piece three of the trumpet players were featured throughout, an authentic practice in bands. Issues addressed with the older group included breathing, acoustics, playing short notes and performance techniques.

The 'Bridge' group which consisted of children from three nearby primary schools and the local secondary school was also observed. This was seen as facilitating continuation before the children were able to go to the nearest Saturday music centre to play with more advanced musicians. The success of the programme has given the children the opportunity to play in a wider range of prestigious venues.

The head teacher explained that prior to the introduction of the programme the school had not had a good reputation in the community. The programme and the formation of school and area bands had changed that. The community was proud of what the children had achieved. She explained the role that music had played in the lives of two children who had struggled

with school work one becoming an excellent drummer, the other a trumpet player. Their musical activities had changed their lives. All of the children were reported to have benefitted in terms of self-esteem, confidence, social life, concentration, and motor skills. It had been inspirational and eye opening for some children. The band acted to inspire the younger children and they wanted to join it. Overall, the programme had changed the culture of the school and the school's role in the community.

Box 4: Example of a successful programme in an inner city deprived area

The school where the observation took place was a small inner city school in Camden with a high proportion of children eligible for free school meals, and high proportions of children with SEND and English as a second language. The school had a strong commitment to music and funded continuation WCET for Year 6. The school had choirs, a recorder ensemble and a ukulele club and on Friday afternoon there was a singing assembly which all staff in the school attended. This was seen as contributing to being part of a community. The children learned to play the recorder as a whole class in Years 3 and 4 and were allowed to take the instruments home to practise. The children were also experienced in singing and singing in parts which supported the learning of the brass instruments in Year 5. Before beginning their brass lessons the children were matched to instruments and were also given some choice. The Year 5 class brass group was observed. The group included trumpets, trombones and euphoniums. The trumpets were divided into three parts enabling clear differentiation. The tuition was in a designated music room which was quite small for all of the children, the instruments and music stands. All the children had unpacked their instruments in their classrooms before coming to band. They all had folders with their music, carefully stored in plastic wallets. The lesson began with warm up exercises using different rhythms and pitches. The WCET teacher led this by singing note names and clapping. Questions were asked about notation and slurring. The pace was fast and the children were totally engaged. After the warm ups the children played several pieces, some well known, some less so. The brass tutors in the class played with the children and supported them in other ways, for instance, sorting out issues with instruments. The playing was interspersed with questions about notation, parts and counting rests. The teacher exhibited excellent rehearsal techniques including the different sections of the band rehearsing their parts separately while the others undertook mental practice on fingerings. When a relatively new piece was rehearsed, the children sang the whole piece together in unison, then each part in unison and finally in parts. The parts were then played separately with others told to follow their parts and do the appropriate fingerings. This was followed by the whole band playing the piece together. When a completely new piece of music was given out, questions were asked about what the children should be looking for when learning something new, e.g. any new notes, fingering. The children then went into sectional rehearsals with instrumental staff taking different groups. Observation of the trombone and euphonium group sectional showed excellent use of rehearsal techniques, breaking the music into sections, singing when necessary, repetition, questions, demonstration, playing with the children and praise. The children identified easy and difficult sections. Some children were listened to individually. When the whole piece had been learned it was repeated because it was 'so good'. The teacher explained in detail how the piece could be practised at home. The band then came back together and played the new piece through. At the end of the lesson the children were encouraged to practise for 20 minutes every day. This practice was to be focused on the pieces for the band. The Year 6 lesson was also observed. Similar rehearsal techniques were adopted but the music was more difficult. The teacher had excellent rapport with the children and they were constantly praised for their efforts and attainment.

Somers Town Sinfonia was developed to support children who appeared to be gaining benefit from the WCET programme and to encourage parents to support their child in pursuing musical activities. It was based in a local secondary school and run after school. The primary school staff took the children to the secondary school. During half-term a range of super-groups each term were run starting on Friday evening going through Saturday and Sunday (superstrike, superstrings, superstrum, superuke, superblast and supertoot). A concert was given on the Sunday. There were Saturday music centres, the levels offered under constant revision to ensure progression. These matched the children's technical level but also took account of the age of the students. When children were in Year 6 and engaged in these activities they had a mentor who supported them and maintained face to face contact with the parents when they left the primary school to transfer to secondary school. This was to support continuation as in London children transfer from primary schools to a great number of different secondary schools. The head teacher of the school outlined a wide range of benefits of WCET to the children including team working skills, independence, responsibility, confidence and also widened cultural experiences which might otherwise not be available. The younger children in the school were exposed to the quality of the older children's performance in the wide range of performance opportunities in the school which inspired them. The quality of the performances always surprised parents and visitors to the school.

Camden music service instructions to instrumental tutors in relation to the WCET programme are that they are to inspire the children, have high but realistic expectations, focus on quality rather than quantity, praise only when it is deserved, provide opportunities to perform, demonstrate for the children, show them performances on You-tube, and play recordings to them. The most successful projects are staffed by a project leader, an instrumental tutor supported by the class teacher and a TA. The whole class becomes a band and materials are arranged and differentiated to enable all students to participate as members of the band. Material is introduced to the whole class, is used to develop general musicianship, notation, responding to a conductor, singing parts, learning how the parts fit together. Tutors have high expectations and engender a sense of progress and achievement. Parents are engaged with the project, invited to performances and encouraged to support practice at home. They are made aware of the benefits of playing an instrument and given information about continuation.

The quality of teaching

The development of general music skills: There was variability in the extent to which the WCET programmes emphasised whether the tuition met the National Curriculum requirements or the development of general music skills. One provider stressed that their programme met National Curriculum requirements and that from their perspective this was the purpose of the programme. *'The WCET curriculum is designed to meet the KS2 National Curriculum requirements for music and provide high quality, first year teaching on an orchestral instrument. The WCET programme is not expected to act as a recruiting tool for small group lessons but remains true to the principles first laid down that every child should have the opportunity to learn an instrument (even if it is just for a year!). It is important to note that, although instruments are extensively used in these sessions, the main purpose is to deliver a general musical education and not instrumental lessons writ large. The sessions will include activities that do not use the chosen instrument such as singing, rhythm cards, music games, video clips etc.'* Other providers stressed that their programmes met National Curriculum requirements. For instance, in Greenwich *'Whole Class Ensemble Tuition (WCET) is integrated into each school's Music Education Plan - every year group has class music lessons based on the National Curriculum, with opportunities to sing and learn an*

instrument. Other providers indicated that WCET met National Curriculum requirements but also stressed other elements. For instance, the Southampton Music Hub programme *'not only teaches pupils to play an instrument, it covers the national curriculum requirements for that year..... Each term of work includes singing, instrumental progression, creative work and notation, with a different genre covered each term.'*

Some providers placed less specific emphasis on the National Curriculum although what they offered satisfied its requirements. Music Partnership North – Northumberland indicated that *'by the end of the year the pupils are expected to have a good level of understanding of how to play the cornet. They will have a good knowledge of the elements of music including the ability to read music and understand rhythm and they will have the opportunity to compose and to improvise.'* Services for Education in Birmingham indicated that *'time is spent composing, improvising and connecting with topic based work in the school curriculum.'* In addition, *'we insist to all our staff that it is all about learning music through playing an instrument and not just an instrument lesson. So obviously there is lots of playing each week and in the early months depending on the instrument delivered, then more time may be spent on posture and technique'.*

Some providers had developed very detailed curricula guidance for tutors. For instance, Love Music Trust in East Cheshire provided guidance for the sequence of lessons, suggested repertoire, suggested activities, performance/instrument skills, core musical skills and outcomes/assessment for each half-term for brass, strings, tuned percussion and woodwind. Nottingham Music Service offer a WCET programme which *'starts at the beginning of Year 4 building on wider school singing and musicianship from Years 1 – 3 and is delivered in partnership with school staff to ensure a coherent follow on. Outcomes include the ability to maintain a pulse, copy a rhythm, play and sing back a short phrase; call and response and following signals for a structure e.g. AB, ABA; following hand signals for loud and soft, long and short; following hand signals to start and stop as a whole class, opportunities to play individually and in pairs/small groups; and play in 4 – 5 different styles of music.'*

The classroom observations indicated that all of the programmes met the requirements of the National Curriculum for music. However, the extent to which these were made explicit varied enormously. For instance, in some classes, particular attention was given to children learning terminology and understanding the meaning of the concepts of pitch, pulse, rhythm, dynamics and so on. In a programme delivered by Dudley Performing Arts, the WCET teacher had devised a song which included each of these concepts. The children had to respond in a semi-improvised way to each term by singing higher/lower, quieter/louder, etc. In another example, a Music Partnership North – Northumberland WCET teacher not only taught the children how to play the cornet but introduced 3/4, 4/4 and 5/4 time in a Year 4 class in a First School also contextualising what they were learning in musical history teaching about Mozart, Beethoven and Holst and the musical historical periods in which they were composing. The children observed from Kingston Music Service showed extensive knowledge of Italian musical terms, for example, crescendo, fortissimo, allegro, which were explicitly taught to the children. Some WCET teachers placed less overt emphasis on the learning of particular concepts but referred to them as they rehearsed the music to be performed. In all cases it was clear that the children had an understanding of basic musical concepts.

Much of the learning was based on playing by ear. Despite this there was huge variation in the extent to which the children were asked to listen and focus on what they were listening to.

There were many examples of the development of children's musical memory through the use of complex rhythm and pitch games. It was clear that the pupils had developed complex musical processing and memory skills.

There was extensive use of singing in the observations. In some cases children had learned to sing songs which were not directly related to their learning of the instrument. In other cases singing was used to assist in learning new music, sometimes with note names as the lyrics. Sometimes children were asked to sing a piece to assist with learning note names when it was clear that they could already play these notes. There was little feedback about the quality of the singing per se. This is not surprising as the WCET instrumental teachers were not specialist singing teachers. Teachers frequently accompanied the singing with movements some of which were complex. Interestingly, a substantial proportion of the children were not able to move in time with the music.

Specific instrumental skills: There was wide variation in the time spent on the teaching of specific instrumental skills and on particular activities. For instance, warm up exercises were carried out in some cases for two or three minutes and in others for as long as fifteen minutes. In some lessons most attention was focused on playing pieces of music, while in others the majority of time was spent on exercises.

Most WCET teachers adopted highly effective rehearsal techniques, breaking the music into smaller sections, getting the children to play them slowly and then speed up, finally, joining the sections together. There was much constructive feedback and praise for the children as they improved. There was variability in the extent to which praise was based on the children simply having learned to sing or play a new piece of music or on improvement in the quality of their performance.

One of the key differences in teaching was in terms of expectations of what could be achieved. Expectations varied between those teaching the same instruments and were substantial, from children learning to play one or two notes to a whole octave in the same time period. In one intense programme in Bromley the expectation for all the Year 4 children was that after six weeks they would be able to play five pitch notes comfortably as a minimum. Repertoire for wind and brass players was developed to support this. In some programmes children were only expected to achieve this after a whole year. In the programme operating in Herefordshire, trumpet and cornet specific outcomes for half a year were that most pupils would be able to play up to eight notes from low C; read staff notation, for example, pitch (octave ascending beginning on low c) and rhythm (quavers, crotchets, minims, semibreves with corresponding rests), ties and slurs; and perform with appropriate levels of expression (i.e. dynamic contrasts).

In order to develop expertise on a musical instrument learners need to be able to practise. This supports the development of automaticity. Practice does not need to be carried out individually and can be in groups as parts of rehearsal. It does, however, need to be frequent if learners are to make progress. In most of the schools visited the children were not allowed to take the instruments home to practise and there was no provision for them to practise at school. Given the lack of opportunities to practise it is surprising that the children reached the standards that many did. Oxfordshire County Music Service not only allowed pupils to practise at home but offered the use of online material provided by the software company, 'Charanga'. Pupils were encouraged to visit their instrument 'World' for extension activities. This includes performance and practice activities that pupils can complete at their own speed.

In some cases, for instance in the lesson observed in Southwark, WCET teachers gave pupils a few moments to carry out individual practice in lessons. In Bolton children worked in pairs to learn a new technique taking turns to be teacher and learner. Some WCET teachers also encouraged mental practice, silently rehearsing fingerings while others were playing.

Box 5: Supporting the development of practice habits

To develop automaticity and the physical skills required for playing an instrument, it is essential that children are able to play their instruments regularly, more frequently than in weekly lessons. Where children were able to take their instruments home to practise, WCET teachers typically reminded them of the importance of practice, stressing that this need only be for a short time, between 10 and 20 minutes. WCET teachers also demonstrated how to practise, illustrating appropriate strategies. In most cases children were not able to take their instruments home. One or two WCET teachers gave children the opportunity to practise in the lessons and in one case children worked in pairs to learn a new technique taking turns to be teacher and learner. In a very few cases class teachers in the school took band sessions during the week or offered a 'clinic' for sorting out problems. Given how important practice is, where children cannot practise at home it is important for opportunities be made available at school. While the children may need some overall general supervision, it is not essential for the practice itself to be supervised. Children can practice unaided or work with a practice buddy. Children more experienced on their instruments could also support the practice of less experienced learners.

Creative skills: There were two examples from the visits where the children had composed a piece of music. In Durham, this had been developed in small group work with the WCET teacher integrating the parts and notating them. The piece was to be performed by the children in the end of term concert. In Southampton, the children had composed an accompaniment to a short set of lyrics presented by the WCET teacher. They worked in groups and then played their composition to the rest of the class. This composition was not notated. In Dudley, the children had previously worked on composing a sound track to accompany a film. A recording studio was created within the classroom and the results were shared with parents and students in school performances.

There were many examples of improvisation. Some of these were framed in terms of each child playing their 'name' and something about themselves, rhythmically, although there were some examples where pitch was also used. The most successful improvisations were where the WCET teacher provided guidance and boundaries for the children. This supported the development of musically meaningful improvisations.

Musical literacy: All of the children learnt to play by ear with an emphasis in all lessons on the sound of the music being the basis for learning. The children imitated the WCET teacher in warm ups, copying pitch and rhythm. There was variability in the extent to which there was a focus on reading traditional musical notation. In some cases, even where children were playing instruments which required the reading of notation in order to participate in traditional ensembles, children were not being taught to read notation. In the early stages of developing musical literacy there tended to be a focus on reading rhythmic notation rather than pitch. In most observations children were familiar with note values and names and rests and were able to play these in time with a backing track or within the group. In one Year 3 pre WCET class in Bromley, where the children were being taught basic music skills and to play the recorder, they read and sang rhythmic patterns from a moving white board presentation singing a single bar pattern while the next one which was different was displayed. They

demonstrated considerable skill at reading one bar ahead remembering the previous rhythm while a new one was presented. This was an example where children's capabilities were not underestimated.

High quality teaching: The observations revealed a range of factors which affected the quality of teaching.

Pace of teaching: The pace of teaching varied between WCET teachers. A faster pace with activities linking swiftly one with another meant that the children remained focused and did not become fidgety. Sometimes when the pace was laboured the children lost focus and although there was no poor behaviour they lost concentration. As one provider indicated it is important '*to make the sessions as varied and as enjoyable as possible keeping the lesson moving on with good pace.*'

Quality of performance and constructive feedback: There was variability in the extent to which WCET teachers attempted to improve the performance of particular exercises or pieces of music. Some provided extensive constructive feedback in relation to all of the activities indicating how the children could improve. For instance, focusing on the length of notes, pitch, balance. There was less constructive feedback in relation to singing. This seemed to be used as a vehicle for learning the sounds of a new piece and its notation. Where the singing activity was unrelated to the learning of a new piece of music constructive feedback was not given in relation to the quality of the singing per se.

Balance between teacher talk and children making music: In most lessons WCET teachers did not spend a major proportion of the lesson time talking. Question and answer sessions in most cases were short and to the point. The children were focused in these sessions. In one or two cases a great deal of time was spent on question and answer episodes, there was little time for playing the instruments and the children became restless.

Making music as opposed to doing exercises: While the children concentrated on what they were required to do when they were asked to play exercises on their instruments these were not going to be performed. The children clearly derived more enjoyment from playing pieces of music. Given the importance of performance, particularly for gaining the support of parents, time would seem to be better spent on playing music rather than an over emphasis on technical exercises. Where exercises were deemed to be important, the most successful WCET teachers gave them interesting labels and made them fun. Successful lessons typically included the playing of well known music, pieces which required improvement and new pieces which offered challenge, although there was variation in relation to this depending on whether concerts were imminent.

Teacher demonstration: Overall, WCET teachers used demonstration much of the time. This was in relation to clapping or doing other movements in relation to rhythm exercises, singing new pieces to be learned and also demonstrating on their instruments. Observing expert musicians is a key element in the successful development of musical skills.

Rapport with the children: All of the WCET teachers had good rapport with the children. In some cases it was outstanding and there was evidence of shared jokes and a strong team spirit. At no point in the observations was there any evidence of poor behaviour.

Box 6: Example of high expectations and the teaching of technique

The observation took place in an extremely small rural primary school in Durham which had mainly white British pupils. It had a higher than average proportion of children with SEND and a higher than average proportion of children eligible for free school meals. A Year 6 group was observed learning to play trumpets and baritones. The children were not able to take the instruments home to practise. Warm ups included buzzing on mouthpieces with a series of exercises which had all been given names and included changes from high to low, low to high to strengthen the embouchure. The children then played a series of different exercises on different notes which had also been given names, e.g. sit down, E to C, three blind mice, E, D, C. They also did finger wobbles which further strengthened and developed the embouchure. The children then played all of the notes of the C scale. This was then repeated with a backing track and different rhythms. They then played a C arpeggio, lip slurs between C and G and notes lower than C. The children then rehearsed a 16 bar piece that they had composed themselves for an upcoming concert from notation on the White board. The children understood all of the notation and could read the music confidently. They were encouraged to save their energy for the high notes. There was a question and answer session about dynamics, crescendos and diminuendos to allow the children to rest their lips. Further rehearsal included two more pieces for the concert.

Box 7: Example of high standards

The school where the observation took place was in Norfolk and had less than 100 children on roll. Year groups were taught together. The children were overwhelmingly White British. The proportion of children eligible for free school meals was broadly average with a higher than average proportion with SEND. The observed lesson was of a group from Years 4, 5 and 6. These children had not worked together before but were doing so because of a forthcoming concert and an intervening school trip. The aim of the lesson was to ensure that the children were confident in what they were going to play and to ensure the highest possible standard of playing. There were ten full size xylophones with two children playing each xylophone. The children were further differentiated into two groups through the use of two colours of beaters. The WCET teacher stood at the front of the group behind an upright piano which he used to accompany the group. The children had learned the pieces that they were rehearsing by ear. The notes were all learned by note names and the children were familiar with the concepts of sharps and flats. The teacher explained that reading notation while playing the xylophone was difficult until quite high level performing skills had been acquired. The children were focused throughout the lesson where professional rehearsal techniques were used in conjunction with short questions and answer sessions. The pace was fast encouraging concentration and the standard of playing expected was very high. This was particularly impressive as the children were not able to practise the instruments between lessons. One of the pieces played provided opportunities for improvisation and the children demonstrated high level improvising skills having been given guidance on the notes to use. The children had considerable xylophone skills and knowledge of technique and were able to evaluate their own performances and those of others.

Box 8: Example of a programme in preparation for WCET

The observation took place in a very small rural school in Norfolk. A Year 3 class was observed learning ukulele and ocarina. Each child had an ocarina, which they had previously played in Years 1 and 2, and a ukulele which they had only been playing for about 15 weeks. Following a warm up song the children practised strumming chords on the ukulele and then learned how to play the note B, helping each other as they did this. Using a backing track they played Bs and Cs with the track which was called Holiday in Havanna. When a child answered a question correctly or played well they were rewarded with a 'Woosh' from the WCET teacher and the other children. Having mastered playing the Bs and Cs on the ukulele the children then played these notes on the ocarina with the WCET teacher adding movements. The class was then divided with half playing ocarinas and half ukuleles. They then swapped. The children then played Twinkle, twinkle little star on the ocarina which they did competently. They all had booklets with 'ocarina' notation. The children were given the opportunity to play alone and some volunteered to do so. The teacher told others to think of note names and fingering while this was going on. At the end of the lesson the teacher awarded 'Player of the week', in this case a child who was new to the class and had been trying very hard to catch up.

Box 9: Example of improvisation and encouragement of continuation through informal learning

The school was an average size primary school in Dudley. The proportion of children from minority ethnic groups was above average as was the proportion that had English as an additional language. The proportion of children with SEND was average but those eligible for free school meals was above average. The children were taught for half a year. The children had experienced half a year of tuition in the previous school year but had had a break of a term and a half since previously playing. The lesson observed was therefore spent in revision enabling the WCET teacher to gain knowledge about how much the children had remembered. The class observed was a Year 6 class. The tuning of guitars was carried out efficiently and was well-ordered. The children were reminded about the resting posture and posture more generally. There was a good balance between playing and question/answer sessions. The children had remembered a great deal of what they had learned in the previous year. About half of the children had bought guitars in the interim period. The WCET teacher encouraged the other children to follow suit. There were clear instructions about fingering and the children copied playing fretted notes. These were practised alone for a few minutes. Preparations were made for an improvisation. Clear instructions were given for which notes to use in any combination and the children were given time to plan their improvisation. The children performed the piece, each child being given the opportunity to improvise alone. The children were asked to select improvisations that they liked and explain why they liked them. Rewards were given out to children who had done well in the lesson.

Box 10: Example of developing a good sound in beginner violinists

The observation took place in a larger than average primary school in Southampton with a mainly White British intake, an average proportion of children with SEND and a below average proportion of children eligible for free school meals. The violin was one of three options for the children running simultaneously. Each class was for 45 minutes. As the classes ran concurrently it was only possible to observe each class for 15 minutes. The start of the lesson was observed. The children unpacked their bows and spent a very short time checking in pairs that they were holding the bow correctly. They did one very brief exercise in relation to holding the bow. The children then played some simple rhythm exercises on open strings. The bows were held appropriately and the children made a very good sound. The WCET teacher explained that as they were preparing for a concert they would focus on improving the quality of the sound, which was already good. They rehearsed two pieces playing with a piano backing track. The teacher discussed with them the three things that would enhance the quality of sound. The children knew these and were able to action them. The quality of posture, bow hold and the quality of the sound were all very good.

Enjoyment and engagement of the children: The observations and the conversations with the children as they entered or left the classroom to begin their WCET lessons left no doubt as to their level of enjoyment. Many children indicated that it was the thing that they most enjoyed at school. The feedback received by providers from school staff and parents supported this with children indicating that the lessons were '*the best part of their week.*' The enjoyment that the children derived from the lessons did not detract from their concentration which for the most part was total. Lapses occurred infrequently when the pace of the lesson slowed or the teacher spent too long talking. In the periods of making music and engaging with musical exercises the children's focus was total.

Assessing the development of musical skills: All providers indicated that assessing children's progress was important. The extent to which this was formalised varied. In Brent Music Service, pupil learning was assessed throughout the year in partnership with the class teacher through a process of continuous assessment. This informed each teacher's lesson planning in order to cater for all learners. As part of the assessment process, children were identified as 'ready' to have specialised instrumental or vocal lessons or signposted to choirs and other relevant ensembles. This was carried out in partnership with the school and parents to ensure that the children who would benefit the most would have access to further music making opportunities.

Services for Education in Birmingham, in addition to ongoing weekly assessment, used a final assessment at the end of Year 4. This was designed with the help of Professor Martin Fautley (BCU) and gave schools a '*best fit*' of pupils and was based on instrumental learning, singing, understanding and engagement. The brass expectations by the end of one year of learning were that pupils should be able to '*produce a controlled buzz on the lips and mouthpiece at different pitches; demonstrate good posture; play with a controlled sound over the range of a 5th or more; sing with confidence in tune and in time; listen to and respond to a wide variety of musical genres and comment on them; have a good understanding of rhythmic and melodic notation and use correct vocabulary; and engage in lessons.*'

In another example, Bristol Plays Music, in collaboration with schools had developed an assessment scheme where progressive targets could be seen to be met by most children, those not quite achieving the targets during a particular term or who were demonstrating

achievement beyond at that time. All pupils received certificates to recognise their achievements as a band. In Greenwich, expected outcomes were clearly signposted, with criteria for each level: Bronze - autumn term, achievable by all; Silver - most will achieve by end of programme; Gold - some will achieve. The children received certificates and those receiving Gold were encouraged to continue learning an instrument beyond WCET.

Love Music Trust in Cheshire East used a system called Stepwise to assess and record pupil progress. This is an online system where tutors can track pupil progress. Data are collected at the end of each term and assessed against specific criteria. Pupils work towards four levels of attainment, bronze, silver, gold and platinum and are awarded with a certificate either at termly performances or school celebration assemblies. The Every Child a Musician programme in Newham has an assessment system in place with London College of Music Examinations accredited by the University of West London. Children are expected to have achieved a Step 1 examination which demonstrates high musical expectations. This is provided at no cost to the school or parents.

Several providers made use of Arts Award Discover. Inspire-works in Sutton reported that the activities in the Arts Award Discover Log Book were very useful as a baseline assessment of pupil prior experience and learning. Facilitators often adapted their teaching as a result of reading the responses written by the pupils in the first homework activity. The level to start the copyback and improvisation activities was also judged on prior practical music making. In Greenwich, in 2015, Year 4 children in one school took Arts Award Discover and funding had been acquired to fund Year 5 children to take Arts Award Explore. This enables children to explore their relationship with music more deeply, facilitating a lasting connection. In Milton Keynes as part of the Bollywood Brass Project, the option for schools to follow Arts Award Discover was built into the programme.

Transferable skills: Teachers (school and WCET) and members of the senior management teams of schools commented on the non-musical outcomes for pupils. These included the confidence the children had gained through performance which transferred to other kinds of activities. Teachers also commented on the improved behaviour of the children. One head teacher indicated *'the music enhances children's concentration, particularly those who have learning difficulties. The children behave in their music lessons even when this is not always the case. The music enhances self-esteem and the children's presentation skills. The children learn a range of transferable skills.'*

The member of the senior management team of the school visited in Bristol, in addition to recognising the musical benefits of the programme, indicated that the children gained in confidence and improved their capacity to perform. They were also reported to develop resilience, perseverance, enhanced listening and motor skills and team working. Children also learned to support each other. Keeping time was perceived to relate to mathematical skills and opportunities to compose and improvise to developing creativity. Similarly, senior school staff in Camden indicated that the programme:

- provided a fantastic opportunity for children and staff to learn something new together;
- developed teamwork skills;
- developed independence and a sense of responsibility through practising at home, coming to school prepared, etc;
- widened cultural experiences, which may otherwise not be available;
- provided opportunities for children to excel in music;

- encouraged children to become more confident through performances at school and out of school events;
- afforded school staff an opportunity to interact with the children in a different context;
- exposed younger children to the band generating aspirations to learn a range of instruments; and
- amazed parents and visitors by the quality of performances.

In Hertfordshire, school staff reported that *'the behaviour, focus, concentration and listening abilities of the class have vastly improved as a result, meaning all round benefits to the other subjects taught.'* The confidence of the children had improved and there were cross curricular benefits. The improvement in behaviour was particularly noticeable when the children played in a large concert venue with other children. They knew how to behave in that context.

In Bolton there was evidence of children developing peer learning skills when asked to work in pairs to practice the use of harmonics on the viola and match the sound with that of using stopped notes on a higher string. The children behaved responsibly taking on the role of teacher and learner in turn and enhancing their skills .

Differentiation: Differentiation was approached in several ways. Some providers arranged parts to provide easy and more difficult tasks for the children. This was observed to be a very effective way of differentiating. For example, across their provision, Southampton Music Hub ensured that *'differentiated parts are available for each song and piece of music. We also challenge our staff to ensure that individual learning is a part of this project, catering for all levels of ability and all learning styles, including those pupils who have already been learning an instrument.'*

The WCET teacher in the school visited in Birmingham indicated that *'As the year goes on it becomes very apparent that certain pupils need support, either to help extend and progress their learning (offering different pitches/rhythms) or by supporting them by making parts and lines more approachable and in this case having specific helpers from within the class sitting near them. I like to use the strengths of the class and have 'buddies' whereby pupils who are showing excellent understanding and musicianship skills can offer some support to those who may find it a little harder.'* In Herefordshire *'learning is differentiated by offering easier or more challenging music as appropriate. Musically confident students have opportunities to demonstrate to and lead their peers from the front of the class'*, while in Nottingham *'team teaching between the classroom staff and instrumental teacher enables a better understanding of the students allowing the sessions to respond to individual needs. As the programme continues opportunities for smaller group, individual and paired playing and differentiated parts are introduced. External opportunities introduced throughout the year such as performance opportunities and creative composition also allow for more individual differentiation.'*

Sectional rehearsals in two programmes enabled more individual attention for pupils. In Bromley, band arrangements with multi levels of difficulty were used, while the smaller group sessions were viewed as particularly helpful to gauge ability and adapt approaches to support the children effectively. This applied whether the children were SEND and required extra help or were more advanced and need stretching.

In addition to this in most classes observed, Teaching Assistants offered support to children with Special Educational Needs and Disabilities. In Cheshire East, the WCET teachers

worked closely with the class teachers to formulate and implement strategies for supporting SEND pupils whilst still setting them high but attainable targets. They also liaised with the subject leader for music to gain a clear understanding of pupils' prior attainment, including those who learned an instrument already. In Norfolk the music teachers were described as *'excellent in responding to the needs of the child and will refocus a lesson on the spot if needed and will ensure children with specific needs are supported and able to participate in the most appropriate manner. Close liaison occurs between the music teachers and school staff to ensure children's needs are being met, and a member of staff learns alongside the children.'* In one observed lesson in a school in Berkshire, there was a child who was an elective mute. He had begun to sing with the other children in some sessions but when he did not wish to engage in this way he was given a percussion instrument to play so that he was included. Other class teachers also reported that elective mutes engaged with singing activities. In Guernsey, the provider had developed a programme which was adapted for special and SEBD schools. In several schools head teachers commented that WCET enabled all children to participate and achieve whatever their academic attainment. In none of the observations were children with SEND excluded from the lessons and class teachers and head teachers commented that children with a wide range of SEND participated in the lessons as equals and that they gained a wide range of benefits from the lessons. WCET also enabled children with English as an Additional Language (EAL) to fully participate in lessons. This was particularly important for children newly arrived in England who had not yet acquired English language skills.

Box 11: Example of differentiation

All lessons have various activities including rhythm games, listening to music, action songs, instrumental work and performing activities. Lessons are structured in a familiar way so pupils are aware of the format of the lesson. Creative and improvisation opportunities are included. 'Enthusiastic' enjoyable singing is encouraged breaking down barriers so all are involved. Instrumental work is structured with warm up activities, and range-building exercises to reinforce previous work and push all pupils forward. All pupils are encouraged to read music from standard notation, sometimes modified to assist some pupils. In composition programmes, graphic scores are sometimes used to facilitate inclusion. More advanced pupils are catered for by using repertoire with two or three parts so all pupils can work together. All pupils are given the opportunity to play something on their own so that individual progress and achievement can be monitored. Games and 'fun' competitions are included (e.g. long note competitions) so all pupils can join in on an equal basis.

Pupil choice: Pupil choice was catered for in a range of different ways. This was sometimes in terms of the instrument played but also in terms of repertoire and opportunities for improvisation and composition. In a small number of programmes children had the opportunity to try different instruments and then select what they wanted to learn. Where the WCET itself involved several instruments children were given choice of what they wished to play, sometimes guided by the WCET teacher taking account of technical requirements, size of instruments and other factors. Where there was no choice of initial instrument, the range of instruments available for further tuition was either demonstrated by staff, through videos, or through performances given by children already playing.

Ensemble experiences: The nature of the WCET provided ensemble experience. The extent to which this provided an authentic musical experience varied. Where WCET was delivered in some form of orchestra or band, the ensemble activity was authentic, particularly when the children were playing different parts. Where single instruments were taught the experience

was frequently enhanced musically by the use of backing tracks which provided accompaniment and a more authentic musical experience. In the observations there were only two instances of the WCET teacher playing the piano to accompany the children's musical activities. The importance of the children having an authentic musical experience which is recognised by others, particularly parents, cannot be overstated. Parents are more likely to support continuation if the musical activities that they see when their child is performing are of a high standard and they are able to recognise them as of value in the wider community. The support of parents cannot be overstated.

High quality materials: WCET teachers need high quality materials to support their teaching including music, learning aids and equipment. Many WCET teachers made use of white boards and backing tracks in their teaching. They were skilled in doing so. The quality of these materials varied. Many of the most successful seemed to be where WCET teachers had developed materials themselves. One teacher in Greenwich had created her own tutor book which was about to be published. This had been tested during the year and had had positive results on pupils' engagement, progress and desire to continue playing. The repertoire was designed to engage pupils through actions, lyrics and improvisation, progressing from simple one-note pieces over a groove, to tunes with more structure and range.

Some WCET teachers had developed flash cards to support the development of musical literacy, pitch and rhythm. All WCET teachers had developed complex rhythm and pitch games to support children in developing their general musical skills. Most had developed exercises to support the learning of technical instrumental skills.

Some WCET teachers had created their own backing tracks which enabled them to meet the specific needs of their pupils. Where backing tracks were played with children learning brass instruments they were sometimes difficult to hear when the children were playing unless they were played at very high volume. Some providers made Charanga available to their teachers. This had the advantage of children being able to use it at home. Services for Education in Birmingham had '*provided every teacher with a Charanga login so that they can feel more confident in this area as well as other areas of delivery.*'

Where WCET was based on brass or windbands, WCET staff had frequently made their own arrangements as there was perceived to be a lack of appropriate resources. These facilitated differentiation. They enabled authentic performance in the sense that the children had folders for their music and played from music stands which they also had to learn to erect.

Overall, WCET teachers spent considerable time in preparation for lessons not only in developing materials but also arriving in sufficient time to set up the teaching environment, prepare instruments and music stands.

Appropriate instrumental resources: The instruments used to teach when the observations were undertaken were generally of good quality. However, there were examples where children had to share instruments in an unsatisfactory way. A challenge for WCET teachers was carrying out small repairs during lessons while maintaining the musical activities. In some cases class teachers or TAs had learned how to carry out small scale maintenance. This was extremely efficient in terms of supporting the pace of the lesson. In many cases the children could not take the instruments home to practise as they were shared between classes, although there were instances where they could have been taken home but the school or

provider would not allow this. In most cases children did not have opportunities during the week to practise at school.

Enthusiastic and inspiring teachers: The observations demonstrated that there was high quality WCET teaching with enthusiastic and inspiring WCET teachers. Senior staff in schools indicated that the personal qualities and professional skills of the WCET teacher were crucial to the success of the programme. Particularly important were the rapport that the teacher developed with the students and the expectations that they had of them which led to high standards of performance. One head teacher commented *‘the lessons are run with professionalism, rigor and joy. The children’s high energy and concentration during lessons reflects the high quality of the teaching and learning. There is much enthusiasm about music in the school and children are keen to perform whenever they are able.’* The quality of the WCET staff was perceived as so important that senior staff from one school had declined to participate in the programme until the WCET teacher that they wanted was available. In Herefordshire all WCET tutors are specifically recruited to teach that programme as the provider does not believe in simply adding WCET to an instrumental teacher’s timetable. This ensures that WCET staff are enthusiastic and committed.

Box 12: Example of a newly developed programme using contemporary music

The school where the programme was observed was in Hertfordshire and of average size with a mainly White British intake. The proportion of children with SEND was above average as was the proportion of children eligible for free school meals. The programme Band-Time was designed as a cross-curricular band method to inspire the next generation of brass players including trumpet, trombone, french horn, flugal horn and baritone instruments. It was written with pop music at its heart, using fun and funky horn lines, whilst incorporating other learning skills that cross the boundaries of all subjects, for instance, listening, focusing, communicating, teamwork. It had a ‘Game-Zone’ which included pulse, pitch, rhythm, aural and memory games. Following participation in the game zone the Year 4 children observed did warm up exercises on the notes B through F. They then rehearsed a piece for the school concert which had a backing track. The WCET teacher improvised on his trombone to a very high standard while this was playing and the children played together in the gaps when he was not playing. The children made organised movements to the left and right as they played copying the kinds of movements frequently seen in big band performances. During this and the playing of other pieces the WCET teacher adopted professional rehearsal techniques, referring to technical issues, including tonguing and breathing in short question and answer sessions. The children made a good sound and the WCET teacher paid attention to the accuracy of their pitching throughout. The lesson ended with a competition to see who could hold a note for the longest time. The WCET teacher was in control of the class throughout and had an excellent rapport with the pupils. The class teacher sorted out problems with instruments having learned to play a brass instrument himself. Initially, the scheme was implemented with Year 4 but was so successful that it is now being followed by Years 4, 5 and 6 with nearly 90 children playing brass instruments. In Year 4, a Band-Time class performs at least one concert a term, performing the material that they have learned, all accompanied by backing tracks specifically recorded for use in the classroom. The performance builds confidence. By the end of the first year, the children have a strong relationship with their brass instrument and are able to perform to a good standard over a range of an octave. From the original Year 4 class, the school now has a 13 piece brass band, which performs to a high level given the short period of time the children have been learning. The children are now showing interest in joining other community music groups outside of the school.

Quality assurance in terms of instrumental teaching: Several providers indicated that they had training programmes for new WCET staff who were inducted into WCET through an apprenticeship model where they worked with an experienced teacher before teaching alone. For instance, the Southampton Music Hub reported that they *‘encourage our staff to share resources, and this has led to a lot of transferable learning within the project. There is a training programme in place to ensure that staff are able to differentiate appropriately and ensure the level of challenge meets the needs of all learners. Differentiated parts are available for each song and piece of music. We also challenge our staff to ensure that individual learning is a part of this project, catering for all levels of ability and all learning styles, including those pupils who have already been learning an instrument.’* Several providers undertook monitoring visits to ensure the quality of teaching and providers indicated that they used feedback from schools in their evaluation processes.

Opportunities for performance

All of the programmes recognised the importance of performance and almost all offered performance opportunities within the school where the programme was implemented. This was frequently in the context of school assemblies, concerts or specific festivals, for instance, Christmas. However, there was variability in the extent of the opportunities available with some children performing very frequently, while for others performance was typically only once or twice a year. It was not possible on the basis of the data submitted to provide accurate information about the performance opportunities available for all providers, however, about a quarter of children were able to participate in ensembles with other local primary schools and sometimes secondary schools, while over half of the responding providers organised mass events for children participating in WCET. Some examples of the types of performance opportunities are set out in Table 3

Table 3: Examples of different types of performance opportunities

<p>In Hertfordshire performance is a natural outcome for WCET programmes when the musical learning that has taken place can be celebrated. Performances take many forms including assemblies, class concerts, school concerts, joint schools’ celebrations, events such as school fairs, podcasts or CDs, open lessons. Links have been made with secondary schools and children from different schools play to each other, the secondary school children also playing. The feedback has been very positive. The secondary school teacher said <i>‘It was absolutely great seeing so many budding musicians – they were brilliant’</i>. A primary head teacher said <i>‘We enjoyed it. Thank you for organising it. It was great.’</i> Another indicated that it was a great experience for the children.</p>
<p>In one of the schools proposed by Cumbria Music Service each class took part in at least two school concerts throughout the year, playing to parents and the rest of the school. Children who participated in the St Pius School Orchestra played in at least three concerts a year. For some groups there were opportunities for performing to the Rotary club and competing in the South Cumbria Music Festival.</p>
<p>In Redbridge, Mosaic Music Education provided opportunities for the children to perform several times in the year in assemblies to parents and the rest of the school. They were also involved in WCET showcase concerts through the music service, and occasionally other projects in partnership with organisations such as the London Symphony Orchestra.</p>
<p>Services for Education in Birmingham provided opportunities for all schools to have the opportunity to put on concerts with whole class and elective students each term. Some</p>

<p>schools had the added opportunity of collaborating with other nearby schools in joint events. There were consortium events where 10-14 local schools brought their pupils together for a day in the Adrian Boult Hall with a concert at the end. There had been departmental days for each instrument by invitation for either whole class or electives.</p>
<p>Participants in Inspire-works (Sutton) finished each term with a performance to the rest of the school and parents. At the end of the summer term, the pupils also performed at the Sutton Whole Class Instrumental and Vocal Festival at Fairfield Concert Hall.</p>
<p>Children participating in the IMT Arts and Sports for Children and Young people programme in Nottinghamshire learnt throughout the year to condense that learning into a performance. Each year the classes were reported to try to out perform the previous group and the standard continued to improve. The performance set a clear goal leading to all pupils being involved in playing complex music. There were several performance opportunities including an end of year concert, carol concert and talent show. In final year performances the pupils had a say in what they played and introduced everything. <i>'It is their show. It provides a goal to work towards and sets the standard'</i>.</p>
<p>The children participating in the bands in the school visited in Camden performed very frequently at school events, for instance, the Christmas Fair, the Christingle Service, the Summer Fair, the Spring concert, and the Leavers Assembly. They also performed with other schools at the Camden Music Service Ceilidh, Camden Music Festivals and Wider Opportunity's Jams at the end of the year. This was perceived as extending their experiences and enabling them to make new friends as the social aspects of instrumental learning were perceived as vital.</p>
<p>In the school visited in Northumberland, in addition to performing in assembly, the children had the opportunity to perform in the local church where the vicar, who also played the cornet, supported the activities.</p>
<p>In provision organised by Berkshire Maestros, two to three concerts a year were organised within the school for the children to showcase their work to parents and other pupils. They were also invited to attend events such as the Big Play Day, where they joined together with children from other schools in the area who had been learning instruments through WCET and performed in a massed ensemble together at the Hexagon. The children also had the opportunity to hear one of the more senior music centre ensembles and had the chance to play with them.</p>
<p>Bromley Youth Music Trust (BYMT) offered an intense five week programme which culminated in a concert every six weeks with every project group of 16 pupils. There were also performances at the end of each term with the school wind band and developing string orchestra. There were cluster Band on the Run performances with multi schools that were invited to join the BYMT Junior Band for concerts.</p>
<p>In the school visited in Kingston staff reported that each term a concert was worked towards and all were encouraged to take part, including those who had continued following the WCET programme. This was to provide inspiration to the newer students. In addition, this school always took part in the Kingston Music Service Wider Opportunites Festival.</p>
<p>The children in Dudley were encouraged to attend Dudley performing Arts WCET projects and large scale events at Symphony Hall and Dudley Town Hall.</p>
<p>Nottingham Music Service's programme included the opportunity to perform alongside the Robin Hood Orchestra at the Great Orchestra Experiment in March and as part of the summer creative celebration.</p>

In Cumbria performance was reported to be integral to the WCET scheme and there was always a ‘perform and share’ at the end of every lesson. The final unit of the year was called Reflect, Rewind and Replay in which the pupils chose their favourite pieces from the year and rehearsed them for a performance. This also consolidated their learning as well as providing another opportunity to perform. At Christmas, three schools took part in a very successful joint celebration where all the pupils played a school item and joint ‘10 Pieces’ items.

For Babcock LDP Music Service in the Devon Music Education Hub, year group performances and whole school festivals were a high priority and had an excellent reputation for very high standards in developing ‘rounded performance skills’ where pupils were encouraged to make choices about which instruments to use and how to create, rehearse, evaluate and perform.

Bolton Music Service provide opportunities for children to perform together in the Victoria Hall in addition to performances at school. Performances are frequently recorded to provide an ongoing record of the children’s achievement.

Progression routes following the WCET programme

In the original submissions and data collected when schools were to be visited, providers were asked to set out continuation rates, in the latter case for the whole WCET programme and for the school to be visited. Some did not provide any of this information. The percentage continuation rates that were reported varied from 15% to 100%. It became clear in the visits that the issue of reporting continuation rates is sensitive and contentious. Where schools were paying for whole class tuition to continue beyond WCET continuation rates could be reported as 100%. In some programmes, elective groups continued in schools beyond WCET and frequently included high numbers of students. These were funded by schools. Other providers reported assessing continuation by the number of children taking small group lessons with the provider. It was not clear whether continuation numbers included children who might already have been playing prior to the WCET Programme or those who took private lessons. It was also not clear whether the data included children who continued to attend ensembles outside the school and possibly outside of the education system but did not take lessons. Informal learning, which now occurs through the internet and children learning with peers, was also not taken into account. Certainly, one teacher had been successful in persuading 50% of children in his WCET class to buy their own guitar. These children did not seem to be included in the data. This suggests that broader definitions of what constitutes continuation need to be developed.

Some providers had recognised that continuation, in whatever form, required opportunities to be available which provided a smooth transition from what was essentially a school based class activity to one where the children were developing an identity as a musician and music was becoming part of their social life.

Provision for transition took several forms. In some cases there were ensemble opportunities in provider music centres either run on Saturdays or after school. Ensembles had been set up for those who had limited expertise on their instruments, at the kind of levels expected at the end of the WCET experience. In some cases, these ensembles were free for the first term. In some cases continuation ensembles were based on groups of local schools, mainly primary but sometimes with secondary schools. This provided a bridge between school based activities and the wider music centre opportunities which were at a more advanced level. The

role of such continuation ensemble activities cannot be overstated. One provider, exploring why continuation rates for one instrument were lower than others, realised that there were no ensemble opportunities for this instrument. This was rectified and continuation rates improved.

High continuation of tuition on transition to secondary school can be supported by close links between primary and secondary schools. In one submission the subject leader at the partner secondary school was able, *'by virtue of his timetable and dual role as transition leader, to spend time working with pupils before they move, allowing them to move seamlessly into the musical 'community' in Year 7'* This was seen as important for continuation.

In Camden, pupils from one school were allocated an adult mentor to support them in their musical activities through the transition to secondary school as in London children move to many different secondary schools from a single primary school .

In Birmingham, at the end of each year pupils are offered the opportunity to carry on with their learning in smaller groups (Electives). Those electing to continue have the opportunity to change instrument from their original WCET instrument if they wish. All are offered the opportunity take ABRSM Music Medals. They are also invited to take part in one of the area ensembles. From there they can progress to central ensembles where they can then follow whichever musical path they wish - brass bands, wind bands, orchestras or jazz orchestras.

In Bromley, the programme is centred around progression. This begins in the school band supported by small group or individual lessons and clear progression to the BYMT Junior Band. Cluster Band on the Run performances with multi schools are invited to join the BYMT Junior Band for concerts giving pupils and their parents the opportunity to see what can be achieved. The next levels are the BYMT Saturday training Band, Senior Band, Symphonic Winds and finally for the highest achievers the Bromley Youth Concert Band, National and International award winners. This band also does a side by side concert each year with the BYMT Junior Band which again provides students with a clear view of what can be attained influencing aspirations. Sharing concerts with more advanced ensembles is a potent way of raising aspirations.

One provider, held a weekend residential course immediately after the completion of WCET to encourage continuation into Year 5. In other cases groups of schools, located geographically near to each other, came together to play and perform. These groups sometimes consisted entirely of primary aged pupils, although sometimes secondary aged pupils were involved.

In Cumbria, many children from the school proposed for a visit took advantage of a range of ensemble opportunities. Some attended Brasstastic, an ensemble made up of pupils from primary schools across the Barrow area. Once the children had made sufficient progress, they could join the Barrow Shipyard Junior Band, which was aimed at children playing at Grade 2–8. In Year 6, pupils were encouraged to think about what instrument they wanted to play at secondary school and to speak to their new music teachers about this.

In Northumberland, children had the opportunity to take part in the school 'mini band' in Year 4 which gave the pupils the opportunity to play other brass instruments to form a brass band. At the start of the academic year over 30 pupils who had been having WCET lessons in the previous year participated in the 'mini band'. As children progressed to middle school in Year

5 they were able to have smaller group instrumental lessons and had the opportunity to join the Youth Band in Bedlington which ran once a month on a Saturday morning. Pupils at the Youth Band had the opportunity to take part in Bronze Arts Award. Following this they could join the county Intermediate Orchestra. There was also a community brass band that met weekly in Bedlington. This band and the youth band had links and sponsorship from a local silver level brass band and had taken part in concerts together.

Providers had also devised a range of ways to support the transition to small group lessons. There were examples, for instance in Southampton, of carousel arrangements where pupils could begin lessons immediately following participation in one part of the carousel if they wanted to learn to play that instrument.

Providers and schools were aware of the financial constraints precluding some families from supporting their children to continue with small group tuition. One of the schools in Kingston, in addition to using Pupil Premium funding to support continuation for some pupils, hired a class set of instruments (from the music service) to make it more cost effective children to continue. In another case instrument hire was free for the first two years. One provider gave a free trial of a term to beginner ensemble participants at music centres.

Some providers commented on the importance of children having the opportunity to see inspiring performances by professional musicians. In some cases provider staff gave live performances or video recordings were provided to support pupils in selecting instruments. Children were also inspired by seeing and listening to more advanced children playing either within school or through large concerts arranged by the hub. Teachers themselves were inspirational in terms of the demonstrations that they gave in class and by also playing with the children in solo roles in performances, sometimes improvising.

In one hub children were aware of continuation opportunities and take up was so high that the provider was finding it difficult to meet demand. Overall, from the submissions and the visits to schools it was clear that it was possible to have high rates of continuation. The issues faced by providers differed between rural and urban areas with those in rural areas having to provide more local activities as music centres were often at some distance and difficult to access. All providers faced challenges in areas of social deprivation. Typically, schools with high numbers of parents from high socio-economic groups had high continuation rates. Where parents faced financial pressures ensuring continuation was more problematic and often relied on the school being prepared to finance it.

The support of parents in relation to continuation was stressed by providers. Those providers in areas of social deprivation faced particular challenges in this respect. In these areas, the most successful strategy for continuation was demonstrating the value of WCET in terms of the children's overall development and confidence. This encouraged schools to pay for WCET to be provided throughout the school. Schools adopted this approach where WCET was of high quality.

Box 13: Example of high level continuation rates through the use of elective classes

The school in Birmingham was a relatively small school with a mainly White British population and a moderate proportion of African Caribbean pupils. The number of children with SEND and eligible for free school meals was average. A Year 4 group learning to play the cornet was observed. The WCET teacher led the children in rhythmic exercises, initially clapping, then buzzing on mouth pieces and later playing on their instruments using the five notes that they could pitch. Question and answer sessions included focus on key elements, pulse, beat, rhythm, buzzing and breathing. The teacher demonstrated frequently and children were also given the opportunity to do so. Notation was taught using materials presented on a whiteboard. Several pieces at various stages of learning were sung and then played with backing track accompaniment, the teacher giving constructive feedback on how they could be improved. The children can continue playing in this school through an ‘elective’ scheme, where large, but not whole class groups continue to play. The children have the opportunity to change instruments at this stage if they wish. The average continuation rate was currently 66% and had been as high as 70%. The children were offered the opportunity to take ABRSM music medals. All the children electing to continue were invited to take part in one of the services area ensembles and there were further continuation pathways through central ensembles including brass bands, wind bands, orchestras or jazz orchestras. The head teacher of the school admitted being very sceptical about the programme at first thinking that the children would not be interested or would lose interest but the children really enjoyed it. The impact was such that the WCET programme is now implemented with younger children in Years 1-3 with singing, ocarina and recorder, much of the tuition being funded through the Pupil Premium. The children take the instruments home to practise and the parents are very supportive. The children perform regularly in school and at prestigious events in an iconic building. The head teacher described the concerts as ‘*the most magical things*’. He stated that this was one of the best three or four things that he had introduced into the school. He stressed the importance of the instrumental teacher being able to relate to the children and indicated that the current teacher did so.

Assessing success

Where visits were carried out, providers were asked how they assessed success. The responses of the 22 providers are set out in Table 4. Overwhelmingly, providers assessed their success in terms of the musical progress of the children. Feedback from schools and continuation rates were also important. It is clear that providers are sensitive to the needs of schools, therefore, what is offered is an important consideration.

Table 4: Synthesis of the ways that providers assess success

Criteria	Number of responses
Assessment of children’s progress (technique, musical literacy, behaviour in groups, quality of sound, quality of performance)	20
School feedback	13
Number of students wishing to continue with small group lessons	12
Pupil involvement in extra-curricular musical activities within school	6
Schools wishing to continue with the WCET programme	8
Children having fun, involved, enjoyment	6
Feedback from parents	5
Number of students joining Saturday ensembles	4
Quality assurance of lesson feedback to each teacher	4
Performance opportunities	3
Feedback from pupils	3

Wider benefits of WCET for schools

In addition to the benefits to their pupils there was also evidence that schools perceived other benefits of the WCET programme. Several of the head teachers indicated that the WCET programme and what had developed from it had changed the school. Particularly where schools were in areas of social deprivation, the high standard musical performances had encouraged parents who would not normally visit the school to engage. One member of a senior management team indicated that *'it has changed some families who never came into the school and now attend the concerts and go to other concerts outside the school.'*

WCET teachers and members of school senior management teams indicated that when parents attended the first WCET concert they did not expect the standard of performance to be very high. Following this, as one head teacher reported *'parents and visitors are always completely in awe of the quality of performances'*. Parents were reported by school staff to be very proud of their children in terms of the standards attained.

In one school visited the school had previously had a poor reputation in the community. The band changed this. In another school the high standard of music had enhanced the school's reputation and supported it with recruitment in a competitive local environment. One head teacher commented positively on how the programme complemented and enhanced the culture and ethos of the school.

Schools also reported that in some cases the programme offered school staff an opportunity to interact with the children in a different context as they were not leading the lessons and in some cases were learning to play an instrument alongside the children. This enhanced relationships.

Box 14: Change in parental engagement with the school

The head teacher of the school visited reported that *'the first concert opportunity we had with the Band-Time project was at a Brass Extravaganza day at the Purcell School of Music. It was difficult to get parents/carers to attend. I believe we had 50% attendance on that first occasion. 18 months on, and our most recent concert at Watford School of Music, had 100% attendance of 50 children from the school, supported by a huge party of family and friends who can now see and hear the benefit of music making in the school.'*

Box 15: Head teacher's comments about the benefits of WCET

The head teacher of the school visited commented : *'WCET has been a huge success at the school. We are now in our third year. The sound of the djembe resonates around the school; and when our year 6 children are combining their complex rhythms the whole hall vibrates and it makes your skin tingle. Our children love it – it's the highlight of their week. Our parents so enjoy the performances and open lessons. One parent said, 'Music lessons are often seen as elitist, but this is truly inclusive'. And it is. Our children with concentration difficulties learn to concentrate; those with confidence issues become much more self-assured; those who excel academically suddenly find that they are learning something so completely new that they might be 'a bit rubbish' at first (this can be an alarming novelty for some) – but they learn perseverance and to laugh at themselves. It's fantastic teamwork. Believe it or not, it also improves reading and spelling! It's true – all our children with significant Special Needs who have done WCET can segment words into syllables and use this in their reading and spelling. "It is also incredibly therapeutic – for pupils and staff."*

Box 16: Example of a school where WCET contributed to social inclusion

In Bolton, the school visited was an average size primary school which had a predominance of pupils from minority ethnic groups many of whom had English as an additional language. The proportion of pupils eligible for free school meals and with SEND was well above the national average. 80% of the children were Muslim. The head teacher had devoted considerable time in gaining the support of the parents in relation to music. The children learned recorder in Year 2, a range of different kinds of drumming in Year 3 and viola in Year 4. The choice of viola was driven by the head teacher who wanted the children to be given the additional opportunities that playing an instrument much needed in orchestras would offer to children from an extremely economically deprived area. The school adopted a range of strategies to overcome Muslim parents' initial concerns regarding their children being involved in making music including discussing with them the religious and cultural issues, ensuring that concerts did not clash with family religious commitments, ensuring that all repertoire avoided religious music and inviting parents into the school to participate in coffee mornings. These strategies had been successful and parents and governors, most of whom were Muslim, supported the musical initiatives. The parents were very proud of their children's achievements. A performance at a large, prestigious venue was particularly important. At the time of the visit the school was arranging to set up a Year 5 viola group for those who wished to continue playing beyond the WCET class. This would be free of charge.

Challenges identified by providers and schools

Providers raised a number of challenges which are set out below. For the schools visited, the only challenge was finance.

Financial issues: Providers and the schools visited raised finance as a key challenge. This was a shared concern. As one head teacher indicated '*Schools are entering a period of reductions in school budgets, which means that all expenditure will be closely scrutinised.*' One provider indicated that '*the pressures on school budgets has had an impact on schools being able to buy us back for whole class continuation sessions*'. Another was concerned that some schools felt that they would only be able to continue with whole class programmes by making that time for class teacher's Planning, Preparation and Assessment or redeploying support staff. Providers in rural areas faced particular financial challenges in terms of being able to offer free access to all of the remote and small schools.

Schools committing to the WCET programme: Providers raised as a challenge the difficulties in getting some schools to commit fully to the programme. In some schools WCET was seen as a cheap alternative to PPA time and school staff were sometimes reluctant to collaborate or participate. Some schools saw the programme as a one-off project, did not see the need for continuation and did not support it. Lack of commitment and sometimes lack of staff expertise meant that children did not receive support for playing an instrument during the week even when they were not able to take instruments home to practise.

Communication: Some providers reported difficulties in communication with schools. Specific examples included offers of WCET not reaching the right person, lack of information about pupils with SEND, and poor communication about timetabling. One provider overcame this by scheduling WCET staff as non-teaching for the first and often last week of the year to meet with school link staff to assess the last year (if applicable) and plan for the next year.

Timetabling: Timetabling was an issue for most providers as most schools did not want WCET to be timetabled in the morning. For example *‘for us one of the main challenges is timetabling across the whole service. Lots of schools are requesting certain time slots and the inevitable request for afternoons. We provide a package for our WCIT where we allocate 1 hour to new schools for the whole class session. A school with Year 4 WCET and electives in Year 5 have 1 hour 45 minutes and then schools that have Year 4 WCET plus electives in Years 5 and 6 receive 2 hours 30 minutes (45 minutes for each year group). So, timetabling can be difficult for an afternoon session and we find staff having to teach through lunch or after school an issue.’* Despite this some schools did support the provision of WCET in the morning indicating that it was possible.

Instruments: Providers raised a range of issues relating to instruments including the costs of maintenance, having sufficient instruments, and not being able to offer a choice of instruments. One provider indicated *‘We have two classes a year and there is only one set of instruments. This means that children cannot take an instrument home to practise. There will be three classes in the year group next year, so the instruments will be used by 90 children.’*

Teaching accommodation: Some providers indicated that there was not always the space to teach particularly when instruments were large and when space was required for music stands. In some of the schools visited designated spaces for music were to be used in the next academic year for increased class intake. This being the case, the pressures on teaching accommodation are likely to increase with further implications for timetabling.

Staffing issues: Providers raised a number of issues relating to WCET staffing. Increasingly instrumental staff are paid on hourly contracts and in a number of cases are self-employed. This has led to difficulty recruiting and replacing staff particularly in rural areas. The hourly paid nature of much of the workforce has created challenges in terms of delivering CPD as staff have to be paid to attend making it very costly. This in turn can lead to issues relating to the training of staff to deliver WCET effectively and ongoing development of their skills. The issue of training and CPD provision is particularly pertinent as some providers reported difficulties in finding staff with the right skills and the resistance of some WCET teachers to be more inclusive in lessons and to adopt an approach developing musical skills more generally rather than only focusing on instrumental skills. Ensuring the consistency of the quality of WCET, always a challenge, becomes more difficult in these circumstances. Issues relating to differentiation and the preparation of materials and repertoire also required opportunities for WCET staff to meet and work together. The issue of insufficient time being allocated to manage such a complex programme was also raised.

Maintaining high continuation rates: This was a concern shared by most providers, with only one provider indicating that they had very high continuation rates which meant that there were challenges in providing tuition for all of the children wishing to play. The challenges were greater in areas of social deprivation and rural areas.

Conclusions

The findings of this research demonstrate that it is possible to implement WCET in ways that lead to high standards of instrumental playing and high continuation rates. To raise standards across the sector requires WCET teachers to have high expectations, to pay greater attention to the development of instrumental skills while continuing to make use of relevant games, exercises and singing to support the development of general musical skills. For most children

WCET provides their first introduction to playing an instrument. If they are to continue to engage with making music, this experience must be high quality. Enhancing rates of continuation also requires providers to have planned progression routes, with no gaps, which support children in making the transition from a class based activity to one where they identify themselves as musicians and musical activities become a part of their social life outside school. In addition, the importance of high quality performances in ensuring the support of parents and schools cannot be overestimated.

Since the initial pilot work for what was then known as the Wider Opportunities Programme in 2001, there have continued to be changes in education policy more generally. More schools have become academies, particularly secondary schools, the role of Local Authorities has continued to diminish and the pressures on school to deliver to challenging attainment targets and meet Ofsted requirements have increased. What were then in the main Local Authority Music Services have become parts or leaders of music hubs. Funding from Local Authorities has largely disappeared and providers rely on funding from schools, parents and that provided by the Department for Education which is managed by the Arts Council. Providers have recognised that in this new climate they need to be more flexible in their offer to schools. To ensure the support of schools, programmes need to be successful in providing high standards which schools feel are useful in enhancing their reputation, engaging students and engaging parents in addition to meeting the requirements of the national curriculum. They also need to complement existing provision in schools. Negotiations about each school's requirements will need to be accompanied by evidence about what any individual programme can offer. Given that more schools are likely to become academies where the national curriculum does not apply, what is offered needs to be attractive in its own right, not merely satisfying the requirements of the national curriculum. Providers might consider asking head teachers who have experience of the impact of music in their schools to advocate for music at conferences or through social media including short videos which could be shown in school visits. There is also increasing evidence of the wider benefits of music which might be used and is widely available on the web. Senior staff in the schools visited reinforced the findings from this research outlining a wide range of transferable skills that were developed through the musical activities including concentration, improved behaviour of the children, perseverance, team working and confidence.

Where WCET programmes were preceded by high quality general music classes they benefited enormously from the prior knowledge of the pupils. Such classes enabled children to make quicker progress in the WCET programme. Providers need to persuade schools that the financial investment in high quality generalist music lessons prior to WCET is worth making.

Overall, the challenges raised by providers, almost exclusively related to issues in schools. All the evidence, from this and previous research, indicates that providers and individual WCET teachers must have good relationships with schools. Without the support of senior staff in schools any initiative, musical or otherwise, is doomed to failure. Massed events where all schools participate, perhaps in singing in a massed choir, can offer opportunities for providers to demonstrate what can be achieved instrumentally starting with WCET. Such occasions enable members of school senior management teams to see what can be achieved and can change attitudes and lead to greater commitment. This in turn can lead to more sympathetic resolutions to issues of timetabling, accommodation and communication. There are head teachers who are extremely supportive of the inclusion of music in the school curriculum and initiatives such as WCET and who recognise the contribution that music

makes to the school. Hubs might consider asking these head teachers to contribute to a short video setting out the benefits of music in their school which could be shown to other head teachers to increase their level of commitment or, in some cases, to persuade them to engage initially.

Programmes also provide opportunities for school staff to develop their musical expertise at no additional cost to schools. Given that the finance available in schools for CPD is limited this should be attractive to senior staff. The evidence to date suggests that class teachers and teaching assistants who do commit to engagement with the programme and learn to play an instrument gain enormously from it. Supporting children with practice when they cannot take instruments home is also a role that is clearly possible for class teachers and teaching assistants, although children can practice individually or in pairs without musical supervision. Providers need to ensure that schools are aware that the more practice undertaken the higher the standards that will be achieved. From the providers' perspective, spending time explaining to class teachers and teaching assistants how to make simple repairs to instruments seems worth the investment.

There is clearly a challenge relating to the availability of instruments in some schools leading to children having to share. Availability of instruments is also related to the extent to which the children have choice and the possibility of practising at home. Local campaigns to increase the number of instruments either through fund raising or public appeals to donate instruments might begin to address this issue.

All of the programmes recognised the value of performance but there were considerable differences in the extent to which pupils had opportunities for performing in and out of school. Some hubs organised joint performances in prestigious venues for WCET programme participants where other more advanced ensembles also performed. These served to inspire pupils and broaden their horizons more generally. Performance was particularly important in engendering the support of parents. When the quality of performance was high parents, even those not normally interested in their children's education, became engaged making it more likely that the children would continue playing. The importance of support from parents in the early stages of learning to play an instrument cannot be underestimated (Hallam et al., 2016).

Whole class instrumental tuition provides the starting point for many children to learn to play an instrument. To motivate and inspire them to continue engaging with music beyond what is offered in school the quality of WCET teaching needs to be high. The observations showed that it is possible for whole class teaching to engender good progress and high attainment. All of the WCET teachers observed were enthusiastic and committed to what they were doing spending much time in preparation of materials. They had excellent rehearsal techniques, good rapport with students and praised improvement. They offered opportunities for improvisation and composition. What differentiated between teachers was their expectations of what the children could achieve and the overt emphasis they gave to meeting the requirements of the national curriculum. There were examples where pupils were able to make excellent progress on their instruments in whole classes while developing high level general musical skills.

Raising WCET teacher's expectations of what can be achieved requires ongoing CPD. This presented challenges for some providers where instrumental staff were hourly paid or self-employed. Some providers reported difficulties in recruiting staff that were predisposed to engage with WCET and had the right qualities to do so. Some providers reported offering

training, while others reported monitoring teaching quality. The latter was undertaken within the framework set by providers for the WCET curriculum which in some cases was focused on meeting the requirements of the National Curriculum rather than the development of broader musical and instrumental skills. There were also challenges in terms of the development of differentiated materials and other resources, for instance, backing tracks. WCET teachers demonstrated confidence in the use of technology but there is a danger of too much reliance on technological resources when for continuation in some ensembles children need to become familiar with more traditional methods. There is certainly the potential for the sharing of materials across and between hubs.

While what constitutes continuation remains a contentious and sensitive issue, it is clear that high rates of continuation are possible where the appropriate systems are in place. Ideally, these include:

- high quality general music teaching prior to the WCET programme;
- high quality WCET teaching with high expectations of what can be achieved;
- opportunities to continue tuition in whole, large, small or individual classes;
- plentiful opportunities for performance in and out of school with some in prestigious environments;
- a range of ensemble provision which children can engage with while participating in WCET or immediately after which seamlessly link with other higher level ensembles.

There is also a need for ways to be found of assessing continuation which occurs in other hub organisations and informally and also to acknowledge that when schools choose to pay for WCET to continue throughout the school that this is an indication of the high quality of the provision and the value that schools place on it.

For further resources and to download this report please visit:

www.musicmark.org.uk/WCETresearch

References

- Bamford, A. and Glinkowski, P. (2010) *Wow, it's music next. Impact evaluation of Wider Opportunities Programme in music at KS2*. Leeds: Federation of Music Services.
- Cooper, P., & McIntyre, D. (1993). Teachers and Pupils Strategies for Effective Classroom Learning: Similarities and Contrasts. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 163, 381-399. Cooper and McIntyre
- Department for Education/Department for Culture, Museums and Sport |(2011) *The importance of music – a national plan for music education*. London: HMSO
- Hallam, S., Creech, A., Rogers, L. and Papageorgi, I. (2007) *Local Authority Music Services Provision (2007) for Key Stages 1 and 2*. London: DCSF.
- Hallam, S. Creech, A., Papageorgi, I., Gomes, T., Rinta, T., Varvarigou, M. & Lanipekun, J. (2016)
Changes in motivation as expertise develops: Relationships with musical aspirations, *Musicae Scientiae*, first published on February 23, 2016 as doi:10.1177/1029864916634420
- Ofsted (2004) *Tuning in: wider opportunities in specialist instrumental tuition for pupils in Key Stage 2: An evaluation of pilot programme in 12 local authorities*. London: Ofsted
- Ofsted (2005) *Ofsted Primary Music Report 2005*. London: Ofsted
- Ofsted (2009) *Making more of music: An evaluation of music in schools 2005/08*. London:
- Ofsted (2011) *Music in Schools: Wider still and wider. Quality and inequality in music education 2008–11*. London: Ofsted
- Sharp, C. (2015). *Key Data on Music Education Hubs 2014*. London: Arts Council England.
- Youth Music (2004) *Creating changes for making music*. London: Youth Music.

Appendices

WHOLE CLASS ENSEMBLE TEACHING (WCET) RESEARCH PROJECT

A CALL FOR SUCCESSFUL WCET PROGRAMMES

Music Mark is investigating the characteristics required for successful WCET programmes that encourage further musical developments and interests amongst young people. Music Mark is seeking nominations for 'best practice' programmes that make best use of specialist instrumental teaching and learning pedagogy within Music Education Hubs (MEH).

Programmes chosen from the nominations by the WCET Steering Group, will be visited by Susan Hallam, Professor of Music Psychology and Education (University College London, Institute of Education) who is leading the research project.

Visits will include:

- Discussion with the headteacher about the school's aims for the programme and how it fits into their overall plan for music
- Discussion with the class teacher(s) and instrumental teacher(s) about the aims for the year and for the session
- Observation of the session, which will be audio recorded
- Follow up discussion with pupils
- Follow up discussion with the class teacher(s) and instrumental teacher(s)

The discussions and observations will be carried out jointly with the person who nominated the programme to provide additional perspective on the session and the wider context and purpose of WCET.

PROGRAMME NOMINATION

- Submitted by (name)
- Position
- Organisation
- Contact Email

What are the features of the programme which make it successful?

For example:

- *How does the programme take account of, and build on, pupils' prior musical learning?*
- *What are the expected outcomes for the year and how do they demonstrate high musical expectations beyond those that would normally be achieved through good classroom music provision?*
- *How does the programme offer differentiated learning, for example, extending pupils who are already learning an instrument or otherwise have more advanced musical skills and supporting SEND or other pupils who may not readily achieve the expected outcomes?*
- *How does the programme lead to further musical learning: specialist instrumental / vocal lessons, classroom music and other opportunities in and out of school? You can include examples of numbers and musical destinations from previous cohorts?*
- *How does the programme support pupils to make an informed choice about the music making they would like to pursue in the future?*

PROGRAMME DETAIL

Please let us know the school details in which the programme takes place.

- Local Authority area
- School name

- School address
- School post code
- School phone number
- Headteacher name and contact email
- Music Coordinator name and contact email
- Is the programme delivered by or in partnership with the Music Service
 - Yes
 - No, please detail

PROGRAMME STRUCTURE

- What instruments are taught during the programme?
 - Please detail

- Does the programme operate a carousel of instruments throughout the year?
 - Yes, please detail
 - No
 - Other comments

- What is the Length of the programme?
 - Whole year (circa 30 weeks)
 - One term (circa 10 weeks)
 - Half-term (circa 5 weeks)
 - Other, please detail

- How is the programme delivered?
 - Whole class (30 pupils)
 - Half-class (15 pupils)
 - Small groups
 - Other, please detail

- Who delivers the programme?
 - Class teacher and instrumental teacher
 - Class teacher(s) only
 - Instrumental teacher(s) only
 - Other comments

- Are performance opportunities integral to the programme beyond the lessons themselves?
 - Yes, please detail
 - No
 - Other comments

Notes

- The term ‘class teacher’ is to include any school based staff member involved in the programme
- The term ‘instrumental teacher’ is to include any visiting teacher/music specialist to deliver/co-deliver the programme

Grade descriptors¹ – quality of teaching in music

Note: These descriptors should not be used as a checklist. They must be applied adopting a 'best fit' approach which relies on the professional judgement of the inspector.

This subject specific guidance is supplementary to the generic grade descriptors which are found in the School Inspection handbook.

Supplementary subject-specific guidance

Outstanding (1)

- Pupils of all abilities and interests make outstanding progress because teaching focuses in a relentless and coordinated way on their aural development, improving the musical quality and depth of their responses, and ensuring their high-level or rapidly improving instrumental/vocal techniques (including good attention to posture). Musical theory closely supports practical activity, also improving the musical quality and depth of pupils' responses.
- Music, as the target language, is used to model and explain – confidently, expertly and musically. Words and notations are used precisely and appropriately to support effective musical learning rather than drive it.
- Pupils' voices are used constantly, not only for discrete singing work but also to help them internalise and understand musical ideas. Similarly, physical movement is used very effectively to help pupils understand and internalise different dimensions of music such as rhythm, tempo and pitch.
- Pupils are exposed to the work of professional musicians and a wide range of historical, social and cultural traditions using a wide range of resources, including new technologies.
- Pupils have the confidence to challenge, ask questions, show initiative and take risks in order to create original, imaginative and distinctive work of high musical quality.
- Pupils with additional musical skills and experience are provided with a high level of challenge, including taking full account of their musical learning outside of school. Pupils who find musical learning and participation difficult, including those with disabilities and special educational needs, and those for whom the Pupil Premium provides support, are given effective help.
- While lessons are always planned and structured thoroughly with clear musical learning intentions, teaching responds very positively to pupils' creative, and sometimes unexpected, responses and builds on these to promote outstanding musical learning.
- Assessment is outstanding because it focuses relentlessly on developing formatively the quality and depth of pupils' musical understanding. Pupils' attainment is considered thoughtfully over extended periods of time with summative assessments taking a balanced view of pupils' work across a wide range of activities. Audio and video recordings are used extensively to appraise pupils' work, identify accurately how their musical responses could be improved further, and consistently realise these improvements.

Good (2)

- Pupils make good progress because teaching places strong emphasis on aural development and practical music-making, linked well to musical theory, helping pupils to respond musically.
- Teachers make good use of music notation where this helps pupils to improve their practical work or where it enhances pupils' musical understanding.
- Performing is at the heart of much musical activity and learners are given every opportunity to

¹ These grade descriptors describe the quality of teaching in the subject as a whole, taking account of evidence over time. While they include some characteristics of individual lessons, they are not designed to be used to judge individual lessons.

Supplementary subject-specific guidance

experiment with instruments and voices, and to experience making music with others.

- Working relationships are positive so that pupils are given the confidence to perform, be creative and learn from mistakes. Learning intentions are clear and simple, focusing on the musical skills, knowledge and understanding to be learnt by pupils rather than the activity to be completed.
- Pupils make connections between their work and the work of others (including established composers and performers), with the aid of teachers, so their work is informed by an increasing range of musical traditions, aspects of theory, genres and styles. Work is made relevant so that tasks are put into context and related to 'real' practice.

Assessment is accurate and gives good consideration to the development of pupils' holistic understanding across all areas of musical activity over time. Teachers listen accurately to pupils' musical responses and correct any errors or misconceptions through good modelling and precise explanation. Frequent recordings are used to develop pupils' listening skills and self-assessment of their work.

Requires improvement (3)

- Pupils maintain a general interest in music due to all lessons including some practical activity. However, spoken instructions, verbal explanations and written work (including the inappropriate use of notation where it hinders musical learning) prevent pupils from making good musical progress. There is more emphasis on knowledge about music than on knowing music itself.
- Use is made of listening, composing and performing activities but these are not linked together effectively to help pupils make good progress in their musical understanding.
- Pupils' responses are assessed informally during lessons; work is marked and records are kept, although the focus tends to be on increasing musical technical difficulty, rather than the quality of the musical response and understanding shown. There may be too-frequent grading of individual musical activities, rather than wider and deeper consideration of pupils' overall musical understanding.

Inadequate (4)

Achievement is likely to be inadequate if **any** of the following apply:

- Teaching takes little or no account of prior learning, for example 'starting again' in the secondary school or not considering learning from first access instrumental programmes in primary schools.
- There is a lack of aural development and too much reliance on non-musical activities (such as written worksheets or internet research that does not develop pupils' musical understanding).
- Teachers' subject expertise is limited, and insufficient attention is given to the development of specific musical skills, knowledge and understanding.
- Repertoire is poorly chosen and little attention is given to improving posture and instrumental or vocal techniques.
- Pupils are not given the confidence or allowed the time needed to be able to perform, be creative and learn from their mistakes.
- Learning intentions are unclear so that different tasks are often unrelated, or they are simply unmusical.
- The needs of all groups of pupils, including higher- and lower-attaining pupils, are not met by teachers.
- There is no systematic recording of attainment and/or pupils' work. Unwarranted praise is given to work of poor quality, and significant errors, for example in rhythm or intonation, are left unchallenged and uncorrected.

The steering group

Victoria Bates	Durham Music Service
Graham Bland	London Borough of Barking & Dagenham Community Music Service/ Music Mark Trustee
Jane Brammall	Trafford Music Service
Sharon Bray	Leicester-Shire Schools Music Service/ Music Education Hub
Ian Burton	Nottingham Music Hub
Emma Calvert	North Yorkshire Music Service
James Devaney	Music Mark
Pat France	Kirklees Music School
Maureen Hanke	Norfolk Music Service
Louise Jones	Dudley Performing Arts
Sheena Masson	Camden Music Service
Graeme Smith (chair)	Croydon Music and Arts Service / Music Mark Trustee
Nicky Watling	Hampshire Music Service
Ben Van Weedon	Devon Music Education Hub/ Babcock LDP Music Service

Providers participating in the research

Babcock LDP Music Service
Berkshire Maestros *
Bolton Music Service *
Brent Music Service
Bristol Plays Music *
Bromley Youth Music Trust *
Camden Music Service*
Croydon Music and Arts
Cumbria Music Service
Dudley Performing Arts *
Durham Music Service*
Every Child a Musician, Newham
Greenwich Music Hub*
Gloucestershire Music
Guernsey Schools' Music Service
Hampshire Music Service
Haringey Music Service
Herefordshire Music Service *
Hertfordshire Music Service *
Hounslow Music Service
IMT Arts and Sports for children and Young people, Nottinghamshire*
Inspire-works, Sutton
Kingston Music Service *
London Borough of Barking and Dagenham
Love Music Trust, Cheshire East *
Merton Music Foundation
Mosaic Music Education, Redbridge
Music Faculty Community Learning MK, Milton Keynes
Music Partnership North, Northumberland*

Norfolk Music Service *
North Yorkshire Music Service*
Nottingham Music Hub *
One Education Music, Manchester *
Oxfordshire County Music Service *
Rochdale Music Service
Salford Music and Performing Arts Service
Services for Education, Birmingham*
Sheffield Music Hub
Southampton Music Hub*
Christine Wright, South Gloucestershire
Southwark Music Hub*
St Helens Music Service
Tower Hamlets Music and Arts Service
Wandsworth Schools Music Service
Providers visited are represented with *

Nominated school WCET programmes visited

Ashton Gate Primary School (Bristol)
Bradfield CE Primary School (Berkshire)
Brownslow Fold Primary School (Bolton)
Cassop Primary School (Durham)
Charlotte Sharman School (London Borough of Southwark)
Chorlton CE Primary School (Manchester)
Highfield Junior School (London Borough Bromley)
Maple Cross Primary School (Hertfordshire)
Marlbrook Primary School (Herefordshire)
Middleton Primary School (Nottingham)
Peafield Lane Primary School (Nottinghamshire)
Plumcroft School (Royal Borough of Greenwich)
St Mary & St Pancras Primary School (London Borough of Camden)
St. Cuthbert's CE Primary School (North Yorkshire)
St. Joseph's RC Primary School (Dudley)
St. Margaret Mary RC Primary (Birmingham)
St. Monica Primary School (Southampton)
St. Paul's Junior School (Royal Borough of Kingston Upon Thames)
The Manor School (Oxfordshire)
Trinity Partnership (Norfolk)
Whiteley Memorial C of E First School (Northumberland)
Wistaston Church Lane Academy (Cheshire East)

Whole Class Ensemble Teaching (WCET) Report 2016

© 2016, Professor Susan Hallam MBE, UCL Institute of Education and Music Mark – The UK Association for Music Education

This document and accompanying resources are available for download online at:

<http://www.musicmark.org.uk/WCETresearch>

Music Mark – The UK Association for Music Education

3rd Floor

8 Holyrood Street

London

SE1 2EL

020 7939 6049

James.Devaney@musicmark.org.uk

